



Princeton University
Center for Arts and Cultural Policy Studies

**Moving Immovables:
How culinary and performative kinesthetics
choreograph space in Cuba and Brazil**

Working Paper #35, Fall 2007

*Nadezhda Dimitrova Savova
Princeton University*

A Program
of the
Woodrow
Wilson School
of Public
and
International
Affairs

Nadezhda Dimitrova Savova is a doctoral candidate in Cultural Anthropology at Princeton University, and also takes courses at the Woodrow Wilson School for Public Policy, where she has received research support from the Center for Arts and Cultural Policy Studies. Savova is conducting research comparing the community cultural networks in Cuba and Bulgaria. She also does research on the cultural initiatives in the favelas in Rio de Janeiro.

MOVING IMMOVABLES: How culinary and performative kinesthetics choreograph space in Cuba and Brazil

SCRUMPTIOUS DANCE AND PLACE

“*El pregon viste la calle!*” Bertha La Pregonera, Santiago, Cuba

“*Aprendi cantar samba da minha avoã quando a gente vendia feijão na rua, y agora danço até quando estou doente...porque com a música toda doença vai embora!*” Dona Dalva, Samba de Roda Suerdieck UNESCO-recognized group, Cachoeira, State of Bahia, Brazil

“*Sabes...hacer el pan, crear la comida en general, es como tu bailar... uno siente la gracia por dentro y la quiere sacar fuera y dar a los otros!*” Enrique, breadmaker, son of Sara, dancer from the Tumba Francesa UNESCO-recognized group, Santiago de Cuba

“*Not only historical buildings, sites of lime and rock, anymore. Heritage is also sweat, dream, sound, dance, manner, vital energy and all forms of spirituality of our people*” (Gilberto Gil, Minister of Culture, Brazil, 2006⁴).

Streets can dance. And so can food. But the best public performance comes along when street and food dance together.

Street food vendors are extraordinary public artists: puppeteers animating fruit in their hands, bards glorifying sweet sensations in their songs. Since human movement, and in particular dance, is understood within space-time formation we can call a *chronotope*, I refer to the site where bodily movements transform space and time to as a *kinetic chronotope*. Chronotopes are “edible” (Kirshenblatt-Gimblett in *Culinary Tourism*⁵), being those particular coalescences of space, time, and the sense tied to the site-specific art of performing the city (Kaye 2000: 34⁶) through making and consuming food in its open spaces. What other energies play in space and time when those are defined by the movements of food *across* the streetscape?

This is the case of the singing ambulant street food vendors (*vendedores ambulantes*) in Santiago de Cuba, Cuba, and Salvador de Bahia, Brazil, whose daily musical circuits scribble on the urban script patterns of *ambulant culinary kinaesthetics*.⁷ This is not to use big words for the sake of academic

¹ “The *pregon* (the songs of street food vendors) dresses the street!”

² “I learned to sing from my grandmother while we were selling beans in the street, and now I dance even I am sick...somehow with the music all pain just goes away!”

³ “You know, making bread is just like you dancing...one has to feel the special gift inside and to want to take it out and share it among people!”

⁴ Gil, Gilberto, Minister of Culture, Brazil. 2006. “Cultural Cartography,” Brochure on Brazilian Intangible Heritage Preservation. Brasilia: Ministry of Culture, IPHAN.

⁵ Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, Barbara. Foreword in Long, Lucy M, ed. 2004. *Culinary tourism: Material Worlds*. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky.

⁶ Kaye, Nick. 2000. *Site-Specific Art: Performance, Place, and Documentation*. New York: Routledge.

⁷ I introduced the term *heritage kinaesthetics* in a paper titled “Heritage Kinaesthetics: Local Constructivism of Cultural ‘Centres’ in a Brazilian *Favela*,” presented at the LAGO Conference at Tulane University, New Orleans, October 12, 2007, *Heritage kinaesthetics* refers to the moving, the kinetic aesthetic *practices*, creatively involving all the sense and in particular “aesthetic” as linked broadly to the arts, that set the built environment alive, or make the visual aesthetics become kinetic. As such, it is a counterpart of *heritage aesthetics*, or the immobile *quality* usually ascribed to a historic site. The five main *heritage kinaesthetics* approaches I proposed residents and visitors of the Open-Air Museum in the *favela* of Providencia in Rio de Janeiro, apply to infuse the “heritigized” site with something “intangible,” include: *visual* (photographing; *seeing*), *ambulant* (walking or moving from place to place [Greek], attentively and/or exploringly), *performative* (enacting intangible cultural heritage practices such as samba, capoeira, football, and music; tour guides’ performances), *oral* (telling

jargon, but what seems to me a useful conceptual framework to think about the production of places through food and all the senses engaged by its street movements. We can drop the “ambulant” part, which comes from Latin and refers to walk, just like “peripatetic” means the same but derived from Greek, and refer to *culinary kinaesthetics* when exploring the spatial social life created by food that is not ambulant sold: food at a restaurant or in the hands of a vendor of *acarajé* (staple Salvadoran fritters) sitting on the corner.

In Santiago and Salvador, I found walking can be anything but a mechanic routine, from peripatetic singing and selling food to walking dancingly: *arrollando* (“rolling along”) in Santiago occurs when you dance with a contagiously exuberant crowd of people playing through the streets a form of Afro-Cuban music, the *conga*. I often ended up going to formal interviews with officials by catching the “conga transit” up and down the hill, noticing people in their bureaucratic uniforms, *arrollando* on the peripheries of the sweaty crowd with care not to get wrinkled for work.

In Salvador, *Swing do Pelo* (short for Pelourinho, the city’s historic downtown) is the group that does “*arrastões*,” or public ambulant dancing events similar to the *congas*, and does them every night of the week. There are sporadic *caminhadas* (big walks) of *capoeira* and *samba*, especially during Carnival, when *rodas* (circles of dancers and musicians in which the two dance traditions are performed) move around the city and stop in streets and squares.

“Edible,” chronotopes can also be musically, performatively “ambulant.” What I observed and embodied was a fusion of two concepts I had developed previously in relation to the first *favela* open-air museum in Rio de Janeiro: *performative kinaesthetics* that relates to the ways in which people enliven the seemingly static (visually aesthetic) architecture through the musical performances they enact within or around those buildings; and the *ambulant kinaesthetics* of walking attentively, knowingly, and appreciatively of the surrounding built ecology. The ambulant dances of the *congas* and of the *Swing do Pelo*, the *rodas de capoeira* and *samba*, and the *Carnaval blocos* “consecrate” places not only through the actual performance but through the kinetic energy of its *displacement* in space and time: an enactment of an *ambulant performative kinaesthetics* among “architectures of time” (see Kwindler 2002⁸).

While for French philosopher Paul Valéry⁹, «no two activities can be more antithetical than walking and dancing,» architecture scholar Paul Carter (1996¹⁰) wonders «What if, say, the manner of going over the ground were itself a poetic act and not merely a prosaic means of getting from one place to another?» (295). To this I suggest that the Cuban *conga* and the Brazilian *rodas* are modes of poetically knowing space, where walking and dancing fuse and graph by foot new urban maps with linear and circular patterns, which however are not divided in Gipson's (1986) linear (*ambulatory*) and circular (*ambient*)¹¹ but each combines the two modalities.

Santiago and Salvador share a joke about how climbing regularly their hills is what produces the beautiful, widely-acclaimed buttocks of the local women. These sensuous topographies impact as much the healthy looks of the individual physical body as the vitality of the social festive body, defined by the remarks of people that «what makes the *conga* are the ups and downs of the hills [*los cerros*]». This ethnographic perspective recharges Paul Carter's suggestions that «perhaps it was the steepness of that

legends/discussing history), and *acoustic heritage kinaesthetics* (creating place-specific sounds). These terms could apply to any place, without the need for it be a historic, heritage site, in which case the “heritage” part is not necessary.

⁸ Kwinter, Sanford. 2002. *Architectures of Time: Toward a Theory of the Event in Modernist Culture*. Boston: MIT Press.

⁹ Valéry, Paul. “Poetry and Abstract Thought in the Art of Poetry,” vol. 7, *The Collected Works of Paul Valéry*, ed. J. Mathews, Princeton, 1955-70.

¹⁰ Carter, Paul. 1996. *The lie of the land*. London ; Boston : Faber and Faber.

¹¹ Gibson, J.J. 1986. *The Ecological Approach to Visual Perception*. Lawrence Erlbaum.

environment, its division into uneven steps, that first inspired the peripatetic chant [of the European bards]» (295).

The mastery of feet would not have been simply a poetic or musical matter, a question of shaping speech rhythmically; it would have entailed understanding the cobbled streets choreographically, letting the white stones that lipped the sloping street at intervals [...] serve as rhythmic marks, incipient bar lines, [...] corresponding to the lie of the land, as actively creating groupings of feet, breath and gesture.

Carter's "politics of the ground" refers to the Western regime of classical dance, which was made possible when the dancer was preceded by the topographer and engineer who eliminated the folded "lie of the land" and cleared a flat dance space so that stumbling is minimized and body discipline and control maximized (Lepecki 2004¹²). However, the hills of Salvador and Santiago, as well as the Cuban mountainous coffee-growing plantations (*cafetales*) were never subjects to such flattening and rather reveal fascinating "cultural landscapes," a term used by UNESCO to refer to the creative interaction between human *immovable* constructions and the landscape. This is a process analogous to the choreography of place – *choreographed landscapes?* – evolving in the interaction between human "*movables*" (bodily movement/dance) and the surrounding landscape and architecture.

Emily Martin (1994¹³) borrows from Geertz (and he from Wittgenstein's analogy between language and the city) the notion of traditional culture being the "maze of little streets and squares, of old and new houses" in the old city center surrounded by the "straight regular streets and uniform houses" of the new suburbs (Wittgenstein 1953:8): in Geertz, the spatial metaphor shifts to anthropologists' ethnographic penchant for the "haphazard alleys" of traditional knowledge – "ancient tangle of received practices, accepted beliefs, habitual judgements, and untaught emotions" (Geertz 1983a:74) – recently spilling into the social life of the suburban street grids. In this study, I also view culture as topography and explore how the movements of food and music shift and re-map its front (tourist) and back (residential) alleys. In Cuba and in Brazil, the food selling animates both the old city and its suburbs, but in Salvador outside of the Pelourinho it is mostly heard at neighborhood markets and increasingly done through shouting and not singing as in the "old days." The *congas* and the *rodas de capoeira* – especially when they move along in a *caminhada* – are mainly concentrated in the old historic parts: in Santiago this is due to the historic spatial formation of the *conga* groups linked to slave communities close to the Port, whereas in Salvador the topographic distribution of cultural activities is more connected to the tourism industry of the old city.

This paper graphs a phenomenological cultural topography of street dance, music and singing as well as a "spatial history of colonization" (Carter: 297) observing how the practices of dancing on folded land resisted and inverted the Western "politics of the ground" that tries to flatten land and "linearize thought" (298).

MOVING HERITAGE

I was walking down a street overlooking the sunset spilled across the Bay of Santiago de Cuba. My companion was Sara Bennet, one of the current oldest members of the *Tumba Francesa*, the Cuban

¹² Lepecki, Andre. 2004. "Stumble Dance." *Women and Performance: A Journal of Feminist Theory*, Issue 27 (14:1): 47-61.

¹³ Martin, Emily. 1994. *Flexible Bodies: Tracking Immunity in American Culture: From the Days of Polio to the Age of AIDS*. Boston: Beacon Press.

dance/music tradition declared Masterpiece of the Oral and Intangible Heritage of Humanity by UNESCO. We were headed to her home for a fresh mango she had brought for me from the close-by village of Caney: a mango that inspired her to sing me a funny *pregon* and make the music rings with her jolly voice. Talking about UNESCO's declaration of the Tumba as "world heritage," Sara mentioned the Director of the District Cultural Heritage Office and how she was trained to deal with "static" (*estático*) patrimony, whereas the heritage that the *Tumba* represents is moving/mobile (*movido*)¹⁴. Sara smiled, handing me over an aromatic mango and saying:

"Moving" heritage is very hard to work with, since it is very sensitive, it is all about how people transmit their knowledge to other people, and too much control can kill it, just like the lack of attention can too..."Moving" heritage is different from "static" since it needs to *move to live* [my italics].

Sara's word choice reveals a particular *bodily experience/embodiment* of cultural heritage that moves the concept of "movement" as the category for classification of tangible heritage, divided into *immovable* buildings and *movable* artifacts (in Spanish, *muebles* and *inmuebles*), and introduces it into the practice of the intangible. This local ethnography of the ramification of global heritage politics is vitally pertinent to the critical analysis of UNESCO and the national systems of cultural preservation. The material/immaterial heritage distinctions – buildings and objects vs practices - is perpetuating the limiting and reductive Cartesian binaries beloved by Western thought. What I thus propose, based on the heritage understanding of Sara, an actual "heritage carrier" or "living archive," is to root in human movement the taxonomies of heritage - needed only for practical, bureaucratic purposes rather than revealing an essence. Heritage could then be roughly classified as *moving* and *unmoving heritage*, only to reveal that movement is perhaps a better characterizing element than materiality, and *not* to claim that buildings and objects are "static" in the sense that they do not move, impact people: such entropy occurs when bureaucratic policies regrettably freeze the use of sites and deprive them of the kinetic human charge generated in cultural practices.

HOW UNMOVING SPACES PROPEL MOVEMENT

As an ethnographer, I felt I had to follow the street performances "home" and experience the non-extraordinary lives of the ambulant groups at their houses, their "immovables." Through interviews and informal conversations, attendances and participation in rehearsals, I noted the extreme importance that people participating in these "moving" groups place on having a fixed place, a house, for rehearsals, storing instruments, and for an activity surprising to me but one that came up on many occasions: cooking! The relation between *moving heritage* and the immovables that anchor it – the actual built cultural associations' spaces (*sede*, or "headquarters," or *casas*, "houses/homes") – offer key insights into UNESCO's "integral" heritage safe-guarding approaches. Spending time with the groups declared world heritage in Cuba and Brazil, the *Tumba Francesa* and two *samba de roda* groups, of Dona Dalva do Suerdick and *As Ganhadeiras*, revealed a dialogue between *fixed cultural spaces* and *moving cultural spaces*, whose concoction is healthy – and often necessary – both for the continuity of traditional practices and for the mobility of a place.

EMBODIMENT METHODOLOGY

This ethnographic research of cultural heritage and spatial dynamics was conducted over three months, June-September 2007, split between Cuba and Brazil. While "choreography of the city" has

¹⁴ Benet, Sara. Tumba Francesa member. Interview conducted by Nadezhda Savova on July 15, 2007.

traditionally been used as a metaphor to refer to the social and physical norms ruling people's ordinary *everyday movements*, what is missing are studies on the *daily dancing movements* in the urban space, such as the *conga*, which create a choreography in its literal, direct meaning. As Susan Leigh Foster¹⁵ emphasizes, space is never a given substance but a constantly created dimension, where one moves *with* space and not *through* space, and this will be my approach to the interactions between *moving* and *unmoving* heritage.

Gil (2006¹⁶) sees the ethnographer and the dancer as “double bodies” both reflexively and objectively analyzing their own movement and the movement around. It is a process of “emphatic kinesthetic perception” where one immediately physically experiences the movement of the other – though often imperceptible to us but detectable by psychologists - upon seeing it human movement. I believe emphatic perception in ethnography bridges bodies and achieves a greater articulation of differences, rather than attempting full immersion into the lives of others, which is not only impossible, but unproductive and reductive for the richness of diversity in human movement. Embodiment became an important analytical concern over the past decade (Browning 1995; Daniel 1995; Ness 1992; Royce 2002a; Savigliano 1995; Strathern 1996), and it is the methodology I apply to comprehend through my own body people's somatic experiences of performance, food, and space. Embodiment is here examined through situational analysis (Garbett 1970¹⁷; Van Velsen 1967¹⁸), useful in taking particular situations and separating them temporally and spatially from social life to purposefully understand how ruptures, variations, exceptions, and accidents fit and negotiate with the systems of regularity.

CHOREOGRAPHY OF PLACE: RHYTHMIC SURVIVAL STRATEGY

When people go into the streets en masse, they are celebrating life's fertile possibilities
(Schechner 1993: 46)

Streets in Santiago led me to daily encounters with the *congas*. The bouncing of the feet off the ground was also a bouncing of dancing bodies off the walls of houses when they squeezed the crowd at particularly narrow street segments. Points of heightened sensation of tension, suffocation, and restraint abound, but only to be followed by a fresh breath of opening, loosening space flowing into the wider street: it is a particular, regular somatic interaction between urban space and the composite body of the crowd that residents of most other places have never experienced.

One day the conga of *El Tivoli* would visit *San Agustin*; then *San Agustin* would visit *Los Hoyos*, the biggest and most popular *conga* in Santiago, passing on the way the *Tumba Francesa* rehearsing its *Tajona* dance in the street in front or inside their *foco*; and so on. Throughout the year the *congas* continue “practicing” in the streets, just not with the elated frequency leading up to Carnaval, and among their passionate followers there are always lively *pregoneros* selling fruit and sweets, economics often left aside and exuberance shared among all, with some *pregoneros* even giving food away.

But why did people in Santiago choose to walk the intense slopes instead of securing a flat space for dance, hewn out of the hill-side, as J.C. Lawson observed in mountainous Greek villages (Lawson in Carter: 296)? Lawson explains it with the «rudiments of ancient drama» still living in Greek dance. Santiago's *congas*, along Lawson's logic, are actually connected to a theatrical tradition, but one that is

¹⁵ Comment made at the CORD Conference, New York, Barnard College: Columbia University, November 2007.

¹⁶ Gil, José. 2006. “Paradoxical Body.” TDR, Winter 2006, Vol. 50, No. 4, Winter: 21-35.

¹⁷ Garbett, G.K. 1970. “The Analysis of Social Situations.” *MAN*, 5: 214-227.

¹⁸ Van Velsen, J. 1967. *The Extended Case Method and Situational Analysis. The Craft of Social Anthropology*. London: Tavistock.

constantly moving, improvised in street skits called *teatro de las relaciones* (theater of relations), establishing *relaciones* (relations) between daily life and broader social issues through humor and dance.

But how can we account for the fact the Santiagueros actually *enjoy* the strain of the rising hill? The *conga* performance exchanges culminated with the *Invasión* of *Los Hoyos*, a huge procession that starts in the afternoon and ends late at night, circulating the city of Santiago and stopping at the *focos* of all the other *congas*. Struggling in the scathing sun, choking dust swirls, and excruciating push of hundreds of bodies, anyone from old ladies stumbling over their walking sticks to children grappling for a gulp of air kept encouraging one another to not give up rolling: «*Arrolla, hermano/a, arrolla!*». They kept singing despite the difficulty, as there would come the point when the climb will reach its peak and shift into an easy-flowing, pleasant, freer walk down the hill. The strain of climbing and the hope of freely descending are both symbolic and somatically lived moments indexical of larger body politics in Cuba.

Throughout the *Invasión*, various people close to me tried to protect me and help me «survive» the massive event. «This is what means to be a *Santiaguera*, you need to live the *Invasión* to know how we live!» people kept shouting in my ears, surprised at the only *gringa* (foreigner) in the crowd. To live in Santiago, and in Cuba generally, is a routine «climbing,» struggling with economic and political ambiguity, yet one done collectively, where people support one another in their daily hardship and often come together in private or public *fiestas* to sing and dance alternative meanings in their lives. To participate and survive in the *conga* is to participate and survive in a society where walking alongside difficulty is not enough, but one needs to *perform*, to *dance difficulty* and to transform it through the peculiar dynamics of the embodiment of strain into an amusing, self-motivating, and collaborative exercise of existence in the *Invasión* of the city just like in the invasion of their private lives by oppressive national and international political economies of authoritarianism, repression of speech, embargo, shortages, tourism, and travel restraints.

In addition to a *rhythmic survival strategy*, the *conga* poses another interesting question: “Why is it that such loud public events take place within a socio-political structure of far more rigid state regulations than in Brazil, where, however, samba groups complain that practicing outside “does not work” anymore with the ever growing traffic and people complaining about noise?” People in Santiago consider the *conga* as such a vitally integral part of the social life of their habitat that it presents, in my view and in my tactile sensing of it, that these daily street festivals present a peculiar materialization of Lefebvre’s (1968¹⁹) dream of the “festival rediscovered,” where the rigid boundary between everyday life and festivity, in the modern world is being rendered flexible, porous, moving, dancing.

A cross-cultural phenomenological study of people’s experience of similar street music movement in Salvador, Brazil, is helpful in thinking about this question. There are no *congas* in Salvador, even though the word *congada* exists and refers to a tradition linked again to the same slave group as in Cuba, the *Congos*: the *congadas* in Brazil are ceremonies re-enacting African rituals of crowning of a “queen and king” with a series of formalized moves and dances. But while Cuba moves in its streets in *congas*, Brazil does so in *rodas* (rings). The *rodas do samba, de candomblé, and capoeira* are circles of people engaged in respectively, ritual, dance, or dance/martial art activity, transmitting messages of peace and respect for man and nature: from shaking the streets of Salvador during the International Festival of Capoeira Art to the world’s biggest “immovable” *roda*, the Maracana Football Stadium in Rio de Janeiro, where I watched children move in circles with a huge white banner saying *paz* (peace) to the beat of *samba enredo*, used in Carnival.

¹⁹ Lefebvre, Henri. 1968. *Everyday Life in the Modern World*. Editions Gallimard: Paris.

The *Invasión* of the *conga* of *Los Hoyos* in Santiago found its counterpart in Salvador in a ritualistic *Caminhada*²⁰ (mass “walk”) of moving *rodas de capoeira*, with players from 34 countries, which commemorated in July 2007 prominent historic and cultural sites along the route from the home of the famous Mestre (*capoeira* instructor) Camisa to the athletic club of the late Mestre Bimba, where Camisa trained as a child.

CAMINHADA AND BATISADO: SPATIAL CONSECRATION AND BAPTISM

The *Caminhada* started around 9 a.m. on an August morning, winding its body and pulling the sharp cords of multiple *berimbaus*, the typical capo It brought together in the streets people from all ages – dancing, eating *bolinhos do estudante* sweets, and laughing with their mouths full – even people who could not walk or dance, but moved in their own interpretations of rhythm in their wheel-chairs or on crutches assisted by friends.

This was the first time I saw people on wheel-chairs around Pelourinho, where usually the gaze meets mostly tourists, local food vendors, and here and there, in the back streets, remnants from the old residents playing chess or sipping beer. But this time, the *Caminhada* took from the secluded houses and into the street, in the burning sun, amidst a sweaty crowd, people who are otherwise rarely visible in the public space. In fact, this time they were more visible than anybody else, as people around made special efforts to ease their movements and protect them from the uncontrolled pressures of the masses, similar to the ways in which I was the object of extreme care and protection in the *Invasión* in Santiago. Somehow, in such extraordinary moments when both violence and revelry are at their height, the spontaneity of “*communitas*” explodes not only in joining the excitement but also in genuinely helping those who are impeded to fully do so.

The dancing crowd also picked up along the way ambulant street vendors whose immediate economic interests soon gave way to a full-hearted participation that people around seemed to enjoy tremendously for the gustatory and olfactory senses they tickled alongside their already tickled feet: the ice-cream vendor was jingling his bell by the *berimbau*, the vendors of chewing gums and balloons were whistling funny tunes, and the *mungunzá* vendor enacted a special hip-swaying groove on the side of his cart, whose sweetly steaming body attracted people with its scrumptious fumes. The additional sensorial experiences that ambulant food triggered in that and similar other street performances created particular “systems of presence” and thus particular “systems of perception” (Banes and Lepecki 2007:7²¹). I propose that these systems produce the peculiar “structure of feeling,” in Raymond Williams’ terms, that characterizes the residents who had grown up to *sensorially know* their cities through the *congás*, *pregoneros*, *rodas de capoeira*, *baianas* and other ambulant vendors.

The *Caminhada* ended in the *Terreiro do Jesus* central square with a *samba de roda*, whose modification in *capoeira* is called *samba duro*, where two *capoeiristas* symbolically fight for the girl in the middle of the *roda*, dance speed and body movement judged here more so than the force of the kick. The *baianas* selling *acarajé* and waiting for tourists to tip them for a picture “caught on” the music’s contagion and jumped in the *roda*, which finally dissolved in a loose samba spilled all over the square and swallowed with delight by anyone, from the vendor balancing his bag of fire-roasted cashews on the dancing shoulders to the *baiana* immersed in her spins of layered dress. The *Terreiro do Jesus* shook

²⁰ The *Caminhada* was part of the International Festival of Capoeira Art organized by the *Associação Brasileira de Apoio e Desenvolvimento da Arte Capoeira (Abada²⁰ Capoeira)*, founded by Mestre Camisa and now promoting a more socially engaged capoeira, called *Capoeira ecológica*,

²¹ Banes, Sally and Andre Lepecki. 2007. *The Senses in Performance*. New York:Routledge.

and shivered under the feet of the *rodas* that transformed it from a square into a living *terreiro de candomblé* (sacred ground), which the name suggests it once must have been.

When the *capoeiristas* headed towards a gym for competitions, I thought the *roda* movements in the city were over. Yet Salvador, like Santiago, never stops moving.

In front of Mestre Bimba's Academy I stumbled across another *roda*, this time part of a *batizado* event, which is week when students' abilities are tested for winning a cord and receiving a *capoeira* name. The *Kirumbê* group from the neighborhood of Itapuã paid homage to Bimba as the mestre of their mestre and then set off to "baptize" the city as they rolled up and down the hills, stopping at the some of the same key places as the *Caminhada* earlier:²² the churches *Igreja do Carmo* and *Igreja dos Pretos*, the *Filhos de Gandhi* Carnaval group headquarters, and Mestre Bimba's museum.

On top the steps of the *Escadaria do Carmo*, perched above the city, a three-year old entered the *roda* surrounded by people from a spectrum of ages and both sexes. His audience, however, consisted of other strangers, clapping from the windows around, down the steps and on the sides of the ancient buildings. A mother is pressing one of her hands to the palms of her baby ... a painter is peeping from a studio, with a few wet brushes in one hand... with the other one, covered in stains, he blows me a kiss.

...*Time is suspended. Music is on. Movement progresses.*

Once in the *roda*, the tiny body exploded in uncoordinated jumps and wriggles to the beat of the *atabaque* drum, provoking around laughter of entertainment but also recognition of effort and future potential. Soon the little limbs entered the rhythm and the feet started drawing circles on the faded stones, striving to catch up with the moves of the adult he was playing...Movements of one smoothly matching the other's curves... *ginga* step ... a kick...a spin....and *ginga* again...gliding slowly in a presente where past had never ceased to be sensed...

...The bodily communication between the child and the adult was the pedagogy of embodied knowledge transmission, of encouragement for creativity, and motivation for strength...The mobile linguistics among adult players speaks a different story, though: one of the elegant tension between fight and dance, competition and cooperation, telling of history and present that have always employed the arts in the struggle for justice and change...be it against the logic of the land-flattening colonizer, showing him that dance can happen on any folded land, from hill-sides to steep steps... or be it against the drug dealers and the police in the shantytowns, the *favelas*, where many *capoeira* groups like *Kirumbê* have engaged youth away from the drug trafficking into a game, a dance, and a fight that strives for the health of the body and the mind in a social ecology that insists on economic and status priorities.

"This is Brazil's civil society!," Mestre Orelha shouts in my ear over the *berimbau's* cry. "They know how to fight not to destroy, but to create!"

...*Time is suspended. Music is on. Movement progresses.*

Kirumbê left around 10:30. On my way to the bus stop, I found myself surprised at the silence of the narrow street: no *berimbaus*?!!! And then suddenly I heard drumming approaching, closer and closer, until at the next crossroad my body was swept by a crowd rolling behind a children's percussion group. Made up of ages 10-14, it was the *Swing do Pelô's* street performance, one of the kids told me,

²² In Salvador, there are a few capoeira academies that share the tradition of doing a *Caminhada* around the Pelourinho each year during the days of their *batizado*, which further reveals the importance of the interaction between people and place, as well as the public spectacle these movements produce for the recognition of the group's value.

which was happening every night between 7 and 11. I stopped for a second, looking down at the winding revelers. On the sidewalk, by the body of the dancing crowd, a few ambulant vendors of roasted cheese were walking rhythmically, expecting a customer who had gotten hungry from the festive calorie expenditure.

The little iron pots, with bellies full of burning coal, swayed like lanterns across the cobbled-stone street, leaping down the slope into a Salvador I felt I knew now somewhere so far deeper inside... not the head, not the heart... I knew in my dancing feet and in the stomach that was savoring the roasted cheese.

...

PONTO RISCADO - PONTO DE CULTURA

“It is the character of the city,” “the sound of the city,” “our heritage,” “the idiosyncrasy of the place”... Those and many similar ones were the exclamations of people in relation to street music performances. The *Caminhada* presents a useful “hyperdefinition” (Hammoudi 1993²³) of the social function of *ambulant performative kinaesthetics*, also inherent but in a lesser density in the more regular, daily ambulant performances of *Swing do Pelo* and Santiago’s *congas*. Discursively analyzed in the words of the people who join them and criticized by some of those who do not but live in houses by which they pass daily, the events are simultaneously glorified for their contagious revelry and criticized for the noise and violence that could arise in the crowds, especially in the *congas* and the when talking about the *blocos* moving during Carnaval.

The violence in these mass events is not to be overlooked, and it does reveal social realities where moments of “collective effervescence” belie more permanent structures of social tensions, inequalities, and constantly contested power dialectics. Nevertheless, there is something about these public festivities - where the same laughter does ring in the mouths of all kinds of people, rubbing wet backs, shoulders, butts, and breasts - something that tells us more vividly about the boundary-breaking force of music and dance particularly when allowed to move in the public space where the streets are the shifting stages – more fun than any static concert stage – for mobile music.

The *ambulant performative kineasthetics* in Santiago and Salvador are modes of “communicating a movement” in Derrida’s terms (1972): communication is the “vehicle, transport, or site of passage of a *meaning*,” where “different or distant places can communicate between each other by means of a given passageway or opening (309²⁴). In the *Caminhada*, the mass movements connected socio-economically different places and thus their inhabitants who otherwise might never meet. The walking dances become a “social mixer” of a kind, creating a contagious vortex as it passes by the houses and pulls their dwellers into a crowd that would in a different social context swell up with racial and economic tensions: yet, for once it moves together to the same rhythm. A peek in works on coexistence gives an insight into what might be going on in such festivities, inferred from a smaller scale inter-personal dynamic:

²³ Hammoudi, Abdellah. 1993. *The Victim and Its Masks: an essay on sacrifice and masquerade in the Maghreb*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press

²⁴ Derrida, Jacques. 1972. *Margins of Philosophy*. Translated by Alan Bass. The University of Chicago Press: Chicago.

When two people are breathing differently, if they play the drum for a while, their breath will synchronize...[...] People experience their interdependence with each other. The drumming creates an embodied experience of how we are connected to each other.²⁵

There is something in the shared musical beat and pulsation of the heart that creates, *conga* by *conga* and *swing* by *swing*, streets laid with footsteps of commitment to coexistence. In Derrida's "general theory of action," "to communicate, in the case of the performative [...] would be to communicate a force by the impetus of a mark" (1972: 321). It was literally through the "impetus of a mark" – through their Academy's symbol on their T-shirts - that the *capoeira* groups were communicating their commitment to youth's social responsibility. The "mark" of Mestre Bimba's Academy is a circle with David's star, which came from the *candomblé* tradition where it was called *ponto riscado* (*riscar* is to "scratch out," "mark," as well as "delete"), made into a tray full of fine wood dust, in the beach sand, or drawn on the ground in order to coopt the will of the deities, *orixás*. Browning (1995) writes that "one such [temporary] *ponto* has achieved a certain degree of *fixity*" (40), as it became the logo of the *capoeira* school of Mestre Bimba.

I expand the semiotically fixed *ponto* to the physically fixed *ponto de cultura* ("point of culture," or community cultural center) in the domain of Brazilian cultural policy. Mestre Bimba's school and museum was declared a *ponto de cultura* by the Ministry of Culture's Points of Culture Program. Created in 2004, the Program aims to "valorize popular culture and insert the local population in a cultural universe through activities in schools and in the communities themselves:" an approach Minister Gil termed an "in-anthropologic point" (*ponto in-anropológico*), which "identifies and acknowledges the living forces [*forças vivas*] that act in society."²⁶ To translate these "living forces" into the very intimate impact that *capoeira* has had on people's bodies, used at *pontos de cultura* as a social therapy of engaging youth in healthy activities infused with civil values, all these performance arts are forms of education of the senses – sensing oneself, others, the city, the State – where we can define " 'enskilment' as an 'enculturation'" (Downey 2005: 101²⁷),

The concept of the *pontos de* spread across the irregular surface – the "folded land" - of Salvador as the tri-dimensional and lasting embodiment of *candomblé*'s bidimensional and temporary *pontos riscados*. In a fascinating way, it is a process that is the inversion of how the Aranda group in Australia transposed from the "folded land" of the body the intricate painted patterns of points onto the flat surface of the canvas, depicting their local environment through "a perpetually self-transforming *pointillisme*" (302) that reveals how the two inverted dynamics of the *ponto riscado/ponto de cultura* and the Aranda *pointillisme* arrived at similar outcomes of cultural adaptation and enrichment. A "perpetually self-transforming *pointillisme*" is, indeed, how Minister Gilberto Gil imagines the spatial distribution of creative communities within his insistence on developing a "cultural cartography" of Brazil (Gil 2006²⁸) where the *pontos de cultura* are imagined as points of creative energy concentration

²⁵ Djanie, Nicholas Kotei, drummer from Ghana and participant in peace-building workshops, quoted in Cohen, Cynthia and Leslie Yalen. July 2007. "Complementary Approaches to Coexistence Work: Focus on Coexistence and the Arts." *Coexistence International Project at Brandeis University*. Available at <<http://www.brandeis.edu/coexistence/>>. Consulted on October 22, 2007.

²⁶ "Salvador sedia encontro de representantes de pontos de cultura," Agência Brasil, Available at <<http://jbonline.terra.com.br/extra/2007/07/13/e13076933.html>>. Consulted on September 18, 2007.

²⁷ Downey, Greg. 2005. *Learning Capoeira: Lessons in Cunning from an Afro-Brazilian Art*. New York: Oxford University Press.

²⁸ Gil, Gilberto. 2006. "Cultural Cartography," Brochure on Brazilian Intangible Heritage Preservation. Brasilia: Ministry of Culture, IPHAN.

that need special massage/policy stimulus of funding and promotion to get even more socially recharged and active.

While *capoeira*, *samba*, and other dances do take place inside many of the community cultural centers, the *pontos*, and on the “folded land” of public squares, I further ask what happens when dance is performed not only *on* the land but *across* it, moving *with* space?

In Brazil, the Ministry of Culture calls *patrimônio consagrado* (“consecrated heritage”) a site of recognized historic value, and the whole historic center of Pelourinho has been declared a World Heritage Site by UNESCO. The notion of “consecration” through the official government recognition of the value of a site was reappropriated and performed by citizens through the *ambulant performative kinaesthetics* of the *rodas* in the *Caminhada*. The process of “consecration” of a site, those movements tell us, is not simply about a discursive labeling that raises the symbolic status of a place, but one of active interaction, of walking and dancing that raise the spatial energy from static to kinetic. It is in the need people express of performing at such urban historic sites that reveals how heritage is much more than the “secular sacred” (MacCannell 1999²⁹), and rather a *consecrated secular*, where human interaction rituals with space unearth the sacred charge of any site, as “secular” as it might seem to have become through tourism influx, structured histories, or cleaning, aesthetically “humanizing” projects.

The consecration spilled on the buildings by the motions of dancing and walking relates to the Japanese notion of *kehai*: it is “when you’re in a room, sitting and you sense a person behind you...A certain vibration that is just beyond tangible, obvious reality” (Yoko Ono in Fisher 2007: 170³⁰). It is in the vortex of air, sound, street and earth, stirred by the foot and spinned in the dance, where *moving heritage* enables the “tangible, obvious reality” of unmoving spaces to assume its full, sacred potentiality. Heritage consecration happens at both the politically symbolic and humanly phenomenological level.

The imperative of the human communication with space has a long history in Brazil’s, embedded in the *candomblé* practice of “consecrating” crossroads (called *encrucilhadas*) by offering food to appease and co-opt the energies of the world intermingling there. In the Cuban *santería* religion, the egg is believed to best accumulate human energies, and though rituals are not enacted at crossroads as in Brazil, those spaces are referred to as *las cuatro puntas* (the four points) and it is to those loci of special circulations that the shaman, called *santo* (*babalorixa* or *tata* in *candomblé*) sends the person who has undergone a *limpa* (cleansing) to throw and break the egg that has accumulated a negative charge. Symbolically, the crossroads are hubs of traffick of both negative and positive energies, and human practices are what helps those get redirected and productively concentrated.

Woken up by the *rodas* in Salvador and by the *congas* in Santiago that both *con*-secrated and *con*-nected, the crossroads walked and danced themselves in a rebellion against their ordinary chained position to only the spots where external factors – either old commercial routes or modern urban planners - made the streets form and meet. Instead, with the *Caminhada* the crossroads circulated through socio-economic spatial boundaries, re-drawn as now meeting borderlines of feet from diverse walks of life that otherwise hardly ever meet: the low-income, dilapidated neighborhood of Mestre Camisa with the touristic, upscale Pelourinho. One could easily note the progressive “whitening” of the *Caminhada* as it kept incorporating more and more tourists on its way. This is not so visible in the *Swing do Pelo*’s daily music marches since they cover only the central parts of the Pelourinho but still provides

²⁹ MacCannell. 1999. *The Tourist: A New Theory of the Leisure Class*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

³⁰ Yoko Ono, pp. 170, in Fisher, Jennifer. 2007. “Tangible Acts: Touch Performances,” in Banes, Sally and Andre Lepecki, ed., *The Senses in Performance*. New York:Routledge: 166-178.

a moving and entertaining site of encounter between residents and tourists that opens a space for interactions quite different from the ordinary mercantile or photographic tourist-resident exchange.

“SOCIAL MIXER” DYNAMICS: HOW FEET *CON*-SECURE AND *CON*-NECT

The Caminhada as a social mixer enters into a dialogue with the ideals and strategies of the most recent public policy strategy in Brazil called *Caminhos da Sustentabilidade*³¹ (Paths of Sustainability). While these *caminhos* have been conceptualized mainly in terms of economic, infrastructural, and environmental reforms, it is important to also view them through the frame of street performance arts, organized by groups part of *pontos de cultura*, now 650 across the country, sponsored by the Ministry of Culture for the purpose of “transversality [*transversalidade*] of culture and management shared between public power and community.”³² For a country that is number 12 in terms of the size of its GDP (Gross Domestic Product) but second worst in terms of income distribution (Gini coefficient) and number 74 on the Human Development Index, economic reforms seem to be giving very little result, cultural policy focused on arts-based/culture-based community development is an important strategy. Though it presents the danger of populist politics that “wash their hands” with only support for the arts, this ethnographic research of multiple encounters with groups from *pontos de cultura* revealed the enormous transformative force of music and dance, mainly through *capoeira* and *samba*, at both the individual and social level of *kinaesthetics* dynamics.

Similar to the *Caminhada*, *Swing do Pelo*, and Carnival processions, the *social-mixer* dynamic is visible in the *congas*, which become the only “sites,” as moving as they are, where locals and tourists can communicate with one another, and often not linguistically but through somatic, non-verbal means in the dance. Otherwise, the Cuban police is constantly on the look for Cubans approaching foreigners, purportedly trying to prevent *jineterismo* (local prostitution/taking material advantage of foreigners) but a *de facto* strategy to limit the few options of contact with the outside world available to Cubans who cannot freely travel abroad. The *conga* is the only site – again, a frenetically kinetic one – where where political, economic, social, cultural, age, gender, and geographic inequalities succumb to a rhythmic re-thinking of shared humanity.

Richard Schechner (1993) explores the festivities in the street space as an arena of contestations between the State and “the people”: “festive actions playfully, blasphemously, and obscenely expose to the general eye for approval and /or ridicule the basic (and therefore bodily) facts of human life and death,” challenging “official culture’s claims to authority, stability, sobriety, immutability, and immortality” (46³³). The fascinating phenomenon in Santiago is that within a regime that has set Carnival within sturdy boundaries of space, time, and movement, the *congas* still manage to “invade” public space and perform their musical “direct theatre” (Schechner 1993), when “large public spaces are transformed into theatres where collective reflexivity is performed, and fecund and spectacular excesses displayed” (83). What is missing in Schechner’s analysis, though, is a further exploration of the role of

³¹ See also book by Batista, Eliezer and Marco Antonio Fujihara. 2006. *Caminhos da Sustentabilidade no Brasil*. Brasilia: Terra das Artes.

³² Pontos de Cultura Program, Ministry of Culture, Available at <http://www.cultura.gov.br/programas_e_acoes/cultura_viva/programa_cultura_viva/pontos_de_cultura/>. Also see “Encontro de Pontos de Cultura na Bahia,” (Meeting of *Pontos de Cultura* in Bahia), *State Government of Bahia, Culture Section*. Available at <http://www.cultura.gov.br/programas_e_acoes/cultura_viva/noticias/index.php?p=27933&more=1&c=1&pb=1> . Accessed on October 10, 2007.

³³ Schechner, Richard. 1993. *The Future of Ritual: Writings on Culture and Performance*. Routledge: New York.

actual *displacement* of movement in public space, of the praxis of kinetics in the animation of the human and architectural bodies.

By comparing the protests in Tiannanmen Square and at the Brandenburg Gate to the Ramlila and Mardi Gras, Schechner looks at the messages that were being delivered but not the *modes* of their deliverance. There is a difference between the dynamics generated in a protest fixed to a place, usually in a square or in front of a key building – *fixed* direct theatre - and a *moving* direct theatre, enacted *across* the urban space. The difference is lived by the body, in its deepest carnal sensations, from profuse sweating to effervescent exaltation powered by the surges of communally-generated energy in the synchronization of the walking/dancing step. *Ambulant performative kinaesthetics* can be understood through Caruth's (1995³⁴) notion of "contagion" of the sense of involvement that one catches in public social demonstrations, taking her example of mass protests to big public festivities, where the words of the people confirm her term: "*es contagioso! te infecta!*" ("it is contagious! it infects you!").

When such *moving* direct theater events are more *regular*, as in Santiago and Salvador, they become markers of social time, as well as markers of the potential fluidity of the taken-for-granted and spatially defined socio-economic barriers between tourists and locals.

Dance, however, is not the only ambulant music and social mixer in Santiago and Salvador. Food is actually a rather scrumptious way of understanding the potential of performances in public space to spice-up social prosaics.

CULTURE-AGRICULTURE, AND THE COOKING OF STREETSCAPES³⁵

The house hosting the *foco cultural* of the Tivoli Carnival group in Santiado de Cuba is a small, colourful place with lots of character. It is perched on top of a hill in the mythical Tivoli neighborhood, cradle of French *café concerts*, raised by the French colonizers who came to Cuba from Haiti, and the home of the now-long-gone *Mercado del Tivoli* that nurtured the tradition of the vivacious *pregones*, ambulant street food vending songs.

The rehearsal room, with its windows generously open to the occasional audience strolling up and down the street, is where I spent many afternoons with the Tivoli musicians. One early evening, walking back from a practice with Luis, the saxophone player with whom I became particularly close, we heard someone singing about the mango he was selling. Luis smiled and said with the unmistakable enthusiasm whenever he talked about nature:

The *pregon* show you how agriculture is inseparable from culture [meaning the arts]. Both nourish you, in different but complementary ways.

Luis' big loves in life were music, food, and nature. Since the *pregón* for him embodied the union of the three, a year before I met him he had done an ambulant performance together with Bertha *La Pregonera*, the most famous *pregón*-singer in the city. Luis had crafted a beautiful cart overflowing with fruit and vegetables, and strolled around Santiago with Bertha singing and him playing his saxophone.

³⁴ Caruth, Cathy. 1995. *Trauma: Explorations in Memory*. Baltimore: John Hopkins University.

³⁵ The term "-scape" implies a relationship between person and environment, object, other person, or phenomenon, such as in landscape, friendship, soundscape. When I use "-scape," I focus more on the relationship, the notion of interaction, rather than the idea of scenes, objects, phenomena or people arranged and perceived at a distance from the observer, as Western analyses has tended to understand through the notion of landscape as visually depicted.

I would have never found out about this project and shifted my whole focus on the street food vendors and their art of place-making as place-cooking, had I not walked with Luis and heard a mango *pregón* in the twilight of Santiago. Ethnographic vagaries take us interesting places, and it is usually the winding path to them that exposed the multiple crossroads of the spheres that Western thought has so neatly compartmentalized, from economics to the arts.

To follow up on Luis' mix of agriculture and culture/art, I checked the most immediately accessible definition of "culture" on Webster's Online Dictionary: culture is "the *integrated* pattern of human knowledge, belief, and behavior, that depends on the capacity for learning and transmitting knowledge to successive generations [my italics].³⁶" My question here is how does the discourse on *integral* food, that I will later explore related to social development, relate to the "integrated" aspect of culture and also the "integral heritage approach" a UNESCO officer in Habana used profusely? To understand this, we need to understand how this heritage came to shape through a relationship that has not been explored in literature: how dance and music in Cuba and Brazil intimately relate to food.

GRINDING THE SONG

Sara is moving her hands in a slow, hypnotizing movement. "Ta...ho...na," she marks each sound with a deep, visceral pressure, with the equal power of the suffering and of the survival of her ancestors... the friction of their joints, dancing the Tajona dance, echoed the crushing of coffee beans...and of human bones crumbling under the effort of rotating the heavy stone wheel for grinding coffee, called Tajona at the Cuban French-ruled coffee plantations, *cafetales*.

"Ta...ho...na," Sara smiles. "The sound of the horrible instrument actually inspired the slaves to sing...I guess it was a way for them to overcome the suffering!"

But the slaves did not only try to overcome by forgetting, by turning the grinding grunt into light music. They strived to become the "self-initiating subject [who] is the miller of the 'mill of modern times that is grinding itself' [...], the real perpetuum mobile driven by the stream of coincidence and swimming in it" (Novalis in Sloterdijk 2006³⁷). By refusing to subject to the mindless, anti-human mill, man converted the monotonous droll into polyphonous pulsations.

"Ta...ho...na," Sara smiles. "At least once a year, dancing the Tajona during Carnival, we dress like kings and queens, and marquises and duchesses...and we thank that our ancestors outlived those marquises and duchesses!"

....

While the *Tajona* songs in Cuba, now performed by the *Tumba Francesa*, were created grinding coffee at the plantation, the sound of grinding echoes all the way to Brazil, where a traveller noticed "their hoarse tones roll forth without intermission like those of a *rough mill-wheel*" (Archduke Maximilian of Austria, in Freyer 2000: 49³⁸). The *jongo* songs in Brazil were invented while slaves used

³⁶ Definition of "culture," Merriam-Webster Online Dictionary. Available at < <http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/culture>>. Accessed September 20, 2007.

³⁷ Novalis, "Europa," lecture presented in 1799, published in 1826, in Sloterdijk, Peter. 2006. "Mobilization of the Planet from the Spirit of Self-Intensification." *TDR: The Drama Review* 50:4 (T192), Winter.

³⁸ Fryer, Peter. 2000. *Rhythms of Resistance: African Musical Heritage in Brazil*. Wesleyan University Press.

to "run in gangs through the streets, each one with a hundred and thirty pounds of coffee on his head [...] moving in time to the leader's rattle, and to a plaintive chant" (Freyer 2000: 47³⁹). *Jongos* were work songs in riddle form, expressing protests and social criticism, which later evolved into lyrics of *samba de roda* songs, especially the *samba chula* with its call-and-response form. Worksongs from Brazil to Cuba⁴⁰, that once originated for enduring the hard daily chores, now live with new meanings as they become dissociated from the painful past and are converted into "heritage," into indices of the unique sensibilities of a place.

The *pregones* in Cuba, called *pregões* in Brazil, to which I will refer broadly for both countries as *pregones*, are the special shouts and voice uses, short refrains or more elaborate songs that street vendors perform to attract attention to their merchandise. These practices exist in diverse forms and to a varied degree all over Latin America (as well as along the Mediterranean coast), but the Cuban *pregón*, concentrated in Santiago, has special musical and textual elaboration that transforms it into a true art form (Miguel Barnet 1966⁴¹), to such an extent that popular singers like Moisés Símons created songs modelled after it, such as *El Manicero* (the Peanut-vendor), that joins others like *El Yerberito* (the Herb-vendor), *El Camaronero* (the Shrimp-vendor), *Frutas del Caney* (Fruits from the village of Caney), etc.

In Salvador, *ganhadores* (literally, "those who earn money," or "breadmakers") were the port cargo carriers, and *ganhadeiras* were the slave women selling on the street fritters, sweets, vegetables, flowers, meats, eggs, etc, either walking in the street with baskets secured on their heads, or seated cooking at a street corner or in the market⁴².

But what is at stake in all these moments of singing while working? Is the song's beat a subversive attempt to counter or at least lessen with melodic beauty the roar and crushing weight of the grinding wheel? Instead of approaching the issue historiographically, I ask phenomenologically: "What kinds of subjectivities do the descendants craft in the vibrations of the voice as it reproduces recollections of their ancestor's pain? Do they perceive themselves as rotating the wheel nowadays, or is the wheel of historical discrimination rotating them in the case of the Cuban *Tajona*? And who is rotating whom in the Brazilian *roda de samba* and *capoeira*?"

A way to look into the contemporary sensations of the *Tajona* and the *samba* is to rethink the fundamental ideal of modern dance in the early 20th century, lauding the autonomous, liberated body, imagined as a "self-rotating wheel" that embodies the political ideal of autonomy and free will. "The 'fleshiness' that characterized the beginnings of modern philosophy was often connected with the dancing body," (Kunst 62⁴³), whose free movements expressed the Dionysian state of spontaneity and non-discursive freedom that could disclose truths about the world by deconstructing with flexibility the stiffness of its norms. "Autonomous, yet never fixed, non-repetitive, never beheld in its entirety" (Badiou 1993: 22 in Kunst⁴⁴), the body in movement was a "circumference in space [...] drawing itself."

The self-rotating wheel in dance is the democratic body in politics, but could we really think of the individual in such boundedness liberated from contingencies, when politics and economics

³⁹ Fryer, Peter. 2000. *Rhythms of Resistance: African Musical Heritage in Brazil*. Wesleyan University Press.

⁴¹ Barnet, Miguel. 1966. *Apuntes sobre el folklore cubano*, Dirección Provincial de Cultura: La Habana.

⁴² Renato Almeida in *Historia da Musica Brasileira* (1942) recorded some songs of sellers of sweets, fruit, and ice-cream.

⁴³ Kunst, Bojana. 2003. "Subversion and the Dancing Body: Autonomy on Display." *Performance Research* 8(2): 61-68.

⁴⁴ Badiou, Alain. 1993. "Ples kot metafora misli," in Emil Hrvatin (ed.) *Teorije sodobnega plesa*, Ljubljana: Maskam pp. 25-39, in Kunst 2003: 62.

perpetually permeate any individual and social skin? In particular in the case of dance, the processes of institutionalization of human movement under national agendas of unity, elite tastes, and normative organization of cultural production quite clearly challenge the notion of autonomy.

As much as somatic isolatedness is ridiculous and certainly limiting, non-productive of a concept, the temporal presence in dance is perhaps another just as evasive and bizarre idea, since the most intrinsic quality, beauty and power of dance - or, really, any performance - is its ephemerality. Time can be fertile in the ecology of human movement only when seen as the open stage on which we can perform alternative, narratives of history:

To perform in relation to the present, however, is not about being in a certain moment, but about using that moment to reveal a different history, about bringing to light the history of forgotten, overlooked and forbidden bodies. Autonomy is not about the exclusiveness of the moment, but about different possibilities of presence and being in the present (Kunst 66).

Indeed, body, time, and space assume full meaning in the dynamics of intersubjective communication, fecund with creative openings. The *Tajona* currently keeps inserting “concrete present time” into “mythical time” (Eliade 1959: 20⁴⁵) through the re-enactment of the rotating grinding wheel in the symbolic dance of two groups moving in circles around a pole in two opposite directions, each one holding the end of a colorful string tied to the pole and thus making the strings criss-cross until they form a beautiful braid (*tejer la cinta* means “weave the string”). The *Tajona*’s circular movements have been recreated in rotating string, drizzled with sweat not from trudging but sweat discharged through collective entertainment. “Heritage is also sweat, dream, sound, dance, manner, vital energy and all forms of spirituality of our people”(Gilberto Gil, Minister of Culture, Brazil, 2006⁴⁶).

While under Louis XIV dance notation reduced bodily movement to a flat sequence, chaining the foot to the page, what lesson of agency can we learn from following the dance-notating French colonizer cross the ocean into Haiti and then Cuba, and noting how the meticulous, script-like minouette was mockingly re-created in sensuous moves by the supposedly powerless slaves? The slaves’ interpretation of the French ballroom dance challenged European superiority twice: dance was not only performed away from the ballroom but *on* the rugged floor of the *senzala* (kitchen and living quarters in one) and *across* the “folded land” stretching the hills of the mountainous plantations, when the songs and dances evolved in the so-called ‘*montonpolo*’ festivities [monton – many; polo – from pueblo, many]. In the *montonpolo*, groups of slaves were allowed to celebrate the Day of the Magos (Dia de Reyes Magos) on the 6th of January, and they would go into the woods to meet with others and freely mock their masters. This is how the *Tajona* was formed, called *Tajona* only later but always rooted in the weaving of the braid [*tejer la cinta*] interpreted as the rotation of the coffee-grinding wheel.

The same tradition exists in Brazil and is currently being recreated at a non-profit for local heritage revival in Cachoeira, near Salvador. The children’s samba percussion group often performs with the girl’s group weaving the braid, but the social memory of the dance in Brazil has already disappeared and its obscure position in the amorphous category of “traditional popular culture” was evident in dance teachers’ amazement to learn from me the movements’ politically charged history in Cuba.

Interestingly, the *Tumba Francesa* dance, after which the group is named, is also a mocking interpretation of the French dances, but the performers insist on it being *baile de salon* (ballroom dance) and thus worthy to be performed inside only, while they classify the *Tajona* as a *baile de calle* (street

⁴⁵ Eliade, Mircea. 1959. *Cosmos and History: The Myth of the Eternal Return*. New York: Harper and Row.

⁴⁶ Gil, Gilberto, Minister of Culture, Brazil. 2006. “Cultural Cartography,” Brochure on Brazilian Intangible Heritage Preservation. Brasilia: Ministry of Culture, IPHAN.

dance). In the case of the *Tumba* dance, the group is thus itself incorporating the Western logic of special status attributed to the ballroom, and yet giving a spin to the Western obsession with flat asphalt surfaces that, as Carter argues, are “negating the charge of the lie of the land” and the “dialogue between foot and ground” (359-360). The times I observed and lived the *Tumba Francesa*, the asphalt floor was more than charged, distinctly felt moving in my feet, with the mesmerizing pulse of the Yoruba Dahome drums that streamed in bloody veins through the dance floor down deep into the foundations of the *foco cultural*, the group’s cultural center supported by the government.

Beloved by the group’s members as their “home,” *casa*, the *foco* is considered one among other special spaces, nurturing its own foot motions. The ultimate question at stake is not about *where*, on *what*, you move, but *how* you move! Instead of asphalt “rendering our walking a largely symbolic activity” (Carter 361), the steep asphalted streets of Santiago de Cuba presented all of us dancing the *Tajona* at Carnival with plenty of opportunities for a largely *sensorial* activity in summoning up vehemence, persistence, physical strain, excitement, humor, and singing to encourage one another up the hill (much like in the *conga* “invasion” described earlier).⁴⁷ Instead of poetically idealizing the manifold ground, ethnography should, in my understanding, be grounded in the many folds of human somatic experiences that are hardly ever “black or white” in virtue of the physical dimensions that freed the senses from racial undertones and endowed them with rich human chromaticity.

LIBERATED STREETSCAPES: MOVING IMMOVABLES

One day in front of a painting of Santiago-born painter Nadereau, I *saw* what my body had been perceiving and what people *meant*, *not* metaphorically, when they exclaimed “the city is moving with the conga” and “the conga is the pulse of the city!” Nadereau’s sketch was of a house with a wheel on each side, as if rolling down the street. “It is my dream that homes can also move around like people, so we can take them anywhere with us,” Nadereau told me. “The city is dancing!,” “The houses are also moving with us!” were not metaphors but, indeed, the particular urban sensory regimes nurtured in Santiago de Cuba and Salvador by the experience of buildings that move both visually and vibrationally with the bodies’ *ambulant performative kinaesthetics*.

In addition to being “social mixers,” the ambulant dances and food songs are also architects of *moving immovables* by making the houses shake, groove, twist, and ultimately really *move* with the pulse of the feet of the crowd. In triggering all the sensations - audio, visual, olfactory, gustatory, tactile, and kinaesthetic sensations - *ambulant culinary kinaesthetics* shows how street food vendors construct scrumptious places through their street circulations, sound, smell, and ultimately flavor distribution, and how this process exists in the reciprocal relationship with people connecting their understanding of place to the food moving in its streets. In addition to having an identity-making (feeding indentity) effect, street food selling and buying is a scrumptious way to taste the dynamics of social coexistence: palatable public place-making (*ambulant culinary kinaesthetics*) here added to the more livable, danceable public place-making (*ambulant performative kinaesthetics*).

Nadereau’s houses on wheels immediately sparked an image of the *minga* tradition on the Chilean island of Chiloé. A *Minga* is any type of traditional community task in Chiloé, the most notable one being to transport entire houses to a new location by placing them on tree trunks drawn by oxen. To

⁴⁷ This is a very different dynamic from the one I observed in the oldest favela in Rio de Janeiro, Providencia, where the dusty soccer field was destroyed by the Municipality to construct a neat square for a museum project, and where that purely aesthetic intervention of flattening did disrupt the dialogue between feet and earth, the people and their place: the difference between an empty *aesthetic* and not dynamically *kinaesthetic* approach to the built heritage.

aid in the community effort, the homeowners are required to provide food and drink for all involved: while the *minga* is an economy of direct exchange of food for movement, in the *pregon*'s economy movement comes as an indirect by-product of food.

The *moving immovables*⁴⁸ in Santiago and Salvador are a kinaesthetically and musically created *minga* of its kind: one with a vividly *sensed* but not actual architectural displacement. The motor home is the modern *minga* but in the process of using engine instead of sweaty hands pulling an oxen something is being lost: the *pneuma*, the *hau* spirit of the gift, the multiple orifices leading into and out of the human sensorium, precisely the sweat Minister Gil mentions as "heritage:" sweat from dancing, pulling...but also of slave's trudging.

With *ambulant culinary* and *performative kinaesthetics*, neither gas expenditure nor hand muscle strain is needed to move houses around and stir social relationships and dreams. While modern artists have tried visually, through projections of images on buildings, to affect a "mobilisation of monuments" (Wodiczko in Kaye 2000:37⁴⁹), the *moving immovables* I explore reveal other, more delicious and rhythmic propellers for this motion. The *conga*, *Caminhada*, or *Swing do Pelo*, all *moving heritage* examples par excellence, choreograph the streetscape in a similar manner that "the railroad choreographed the landscape" (granted, at a far lower speed): "the motion of the train shrank space, and thus displayed in immediate succession objects and pieces of scenery that in their original spatiality belonged to separate realms:" it is "the ability to perceive the discrete, as it rolls past the window, indiscriminately" (60-61⁵⁰). Moving in these street dances one has the experience of being carried by the shaking, panting body of a train, and yet the dance gives a spin to any modern insistence on machines being the preferred mode of displacement. Indeed, dancing walking provides the alternative missing in Sloterdijk's (2006) constatation that the automobile has become "the cultural center of a kinetic world religion," where "it is the rolling sacrament that makes us participate in something faster than ourselves," as we "realize that we are predestined to a life beyond the animal-like life of pedestrians" (39). In Santiago and Salvador, one does not need a car but a pair of fit feet to turn the "animal-like," "prosaic" walking in Valéry's terms, into a poetic dance and a rhythmic pull of the surrounding spaces. While "the soundscape moves *with* the sentient as they move through the environment and it continually changes with our behavioural interactions [*italics mine*]" (Rodaway: 87⁵¹), the architecture and landscape also move *with* the sentient, be in the emission of music and food aromas or the emission of dance vibrations.

....

Two weeks after sipping coffee with Nadereau in his colorful apartment, across a patio echoing with noisy neighbors, I found myself holding a cup of aromatic coffee next to a gypsy woman, at her wooden table in a garden, somewhere in the suburbs of Rio de Janeiro. Across her patio, an old car blasting gypsy music animated the street. A barking dog was playing with a man.

⁴⁸ The idea of moving immovables especially linked to the *minga* is interestingly played in modern companies like the Moving Heritage Company (<http://britskymovers.com/heritage.htm>) that transport whole buildings from one location to another.

⁴⁹ Wodiczko, Krzysztof, Polish architect, quoted in Kaye, Nick. 2000. *Site-Specific Art: Performance, Place, and Documentation*. New York: Routledge.

⁵⁰ Schivelbusch, Wolfgang. 1986 [1977]. *The Railway Journey: The Industrialization of Time and Space in the 19th Century*. Berkeley: The University of California Press.

⁵¹ Rodaway, Paul. 1994c. *Sensuous geographies: body, sense, and place*. London ; New York : Routledge.

The woman's family had, once upon a time, immigrated to Brazil from Serbia, only a few hours across the border from my birthplace. She grew up in a nomadic caravan, and remembered how her uncle made living with itinerant cinema, connecting isolated places through fleeting images on a sheet performing the screen and a foldable circus-like tent (*lona*) in the role of the roof: a movable immovable "house of culture" *par excellence!*

"I miss the freedom of constant movement, of not being fixed to a place, to a house," a spark of melancholy flashed in her eyes at the image of a winding road lost in the distance. "And yet now I love the safety of my home...I *love* having a bathroom!" she smiled.

I myself had just come from a nomadic lifestyle, or better: an *ambulant performative* one, weeks spent pulling houses on imagined wheels with the *congas* of Santiago. And now I was finding myself in the house of a settled gypsy dreaming about the bitter-sweetness of chosen homelessness: the house emerged as a hybrid space suspended in between and betwixt, a *liminal space* – to paraphrase Van Genep's "liminal state" in ritual– mediating between motion and rest, freedom and restraint, adventure and safety. But what if...what if built houses can move like a musical caravan and yet never physically leave their spot?

....

The *minga* is a practice that takes place within a cultural landscape of wooden churches in Chiloé declared a world heritage site that I discussed two weeks earlier with Victor Marin at UNESCO in Habana. For him, it was an embodiment of a material heritage space that was essentially kept alive by a cultural practice, and the practice is defined by the space, and should thus also be considered "cultural space" within the language of the Intangible Heritage Convention.⁵²

Nadereau's dream of ambulant buildings came true in Santiago but in a sense far less literal than in Chiloé, emerging from the symbolic, rhythmic, vibrating texture of the dancing public spaces. Santiago's houses were rolling down and up the streets, moving side by side with the crowd – people, on their part, dancing *with* and not *through* space, as dance scholars usually analyze – while the houses build up a slender body like the beautifully-rounded female *nalgas*: instead of fetishizing the female buttocks, I am rather anthropomorphizing the body of the house in these urban kinaesthetics. Just like their owners, the houses shake, wriggle, twist, laugh, shout, go down, and *mueven la cintura* and sing in the contagious chorus of their residents' steps. *Arrollar* is sonorally and perhaps even etymologically connected to the English "roll," and though Cubans think of it as the act of dancing while walking – or walking while dancing – it is also the act of making buildings roll with humans.

Going back to the case of the *foco cultural* of the *Tumba Francesa* in Santiago de Cuba, I challenge Carter's argument that "in no way does the poet [the European bard] sacralize the ground where he sings: it is flat, a floor within a building, its topographical charge already negated" (Carter: 308). Yet, the *ambulant performative kinaesthetics* spin around both the colonial oppressive strategies of flattening the land, as well as the post-colonial academic infatuation with the poetics of untamed ground and free-moving bodies. Because listening to what people actually have to say, I found that the *conga* groups, the *Swing do Pelo*, the *samba de roda* and *capoeira* groups claim the importance of having "a floor within a building," an actual "house," where to practice, to store instruments, host performances, etc, and believe it is the government's responsibility as owner of public space to provide form that space places for social creativity for these groups. These practical and emotional needs for a "home" need to

⁵² Marin, Victor. Office of Intangible Heritage. UNESCO Cluster Office for Latin America. Habana, Cuba. Interview conducted by Nadezhda Savova on July 4, 2007.

be taken into consideration in the abstract statements of Minister of Culture of Brazil, Gilberto Gil, that heritage is to be thought “with transcendence, beyond walls, beyond backyards, beyond limits” (Gil 2006⁵³). It sounds cute, but intangible heritage is also to be understood tangibly and spatially in order to actively participate in people’s living of the communal and spiritual dynamics of cultural memory.

When asking *Swing do Pelo*’s members why they decided to have the daily ambulant performances, the most common answer was that it was so much more “dynamic” and “fun” than just a static performance, synthesized in the words of one of the young players: “There is so much energy when all our drums play together...so felt we needed to move, to spread it, and we decided to walk and play!” This peripatetic release of creative energy, however, is interestingly linked to having a “home” from which to depart and where to return to store the instruments, hold classes and meetings, and have celebrations: an “immovable” necessary to host *moving heritage*.

The ground in Paul Carter is not a pre-given topography but it is created together with the body in a dynamic, interactive process of intersubjectivity. The asphalted ground did not prevent the *capoeiristas* to spring off its surface in their improvised *rodas* and thus create vibrations within a land that was not institutionally meant – but is now artistically sculpted – to reverberate. As far as the rigid floor, the concern of the capoeira groups with having their own *espaço* is a tangible index of the importance of a material space for tradition to be transmitted *spatially* – not just in bad weather outside but mentally imagined as connected to a lasting physical place and not the temporality of the life of a mestre – when, unlike food, performance cannot be transmitted only *haptically*.

Swing do Pelo’s ambulant performances were supported by the *Instituto do Patrimônio Artístico e Cultural* (IPAC) of Salvador by ceding the group a space for rehearsal/storage in the Pelourinho. Indeed, the public support for their daily performances is an interesting instance of recognition of the “legality” of such loud, unruly events, which in other “heritage sites” might be completely prohibited for disrupting the order of the historic place. Traditionally, Salvador’s main cultural “movers and shakers” do not move in lines as in Santiago but rather in circles: the *rodas* of *capoeira da rua* in the city squares and streets. For a few events each year, mainly for the July 2nd Liberation Day, these *rodas* start moving around, suffusing the urban veins with the *berimbau*’s pulse, like the smaller *caminhada* of the *Kirumbe capoeira* group.

SHAKING THE CULTURAL MARACA: OPENING SPACES

One night, a few rays of light were cutting through puffs of incense that rolled out the half-opened door and down the steps in front of *Swing do Pelo*’s house, across from UNESCO’s Office. The smell of an herb infused my senses: immediately, the topsy-turvy of olfactory memory thrust me in a dancing street in Cuba. I opened my eyes. With merry shouts, kids were carrying drums often bigger than themselves, yet with lightness only possible due to their exuberant impatience to play.

“Smell it! Can you smell its power?! We are cleansing the drums with *axé*, so that they play for peace, for driving the bad things away...you know, we want to make people walk around with only good thoughts!,” shared *Swing*’s Director, echoing the peace appeals of *capoeira* schools and other Carnival groups, such as Olodum and Filhos de Gandi. In the logic of *ambulant culinary kinaesthetics*, the use of *axé* in *Swing*’s ritual is both a symbolic re-enactment of a ritual – the *axé* being a signifier of peace – but also, and perhaps more importantly, an actual transformative bodily experience of a smell that opens a rich immediate

⁵³Gil, Gilberto. 2006. “Cultural Cartography,” Brochure on Brazilian Intangible Heritage Preservation. Brasília: Ministry of Culture, IPHAN.

sensory living of the soothing aroma. The word *axé* comes from the Yoruba word *ase* for performers, or people of action, and it is, indeed, “people of action” that the ambulant music from the *axé*-bathed drums gathers around the fast-beating children’s palms and the rhythmic steps trembling with Salvador’s streets every night of the week.

Axé circles kept swirling around the banners of UNESCO and the United Nations, whose stylized globe now flies in many countries through the campaigns of the International Decade of Culture of Peace and Non-Violence. Earlier that day, I was inside the office, talking with an officer about UNESCO’s project *Abrindo Espaços* (Opening Spaces), which expanded into the Ministry of Education’s *Escola Aberta* (Open School) Program that I had explored in January 2007 in Nova Iguaçu, Rio de Janeiro state. Operating in more than 2,500 schools, it has been a policy that dynamically integrated the school with its community through weekend cultural and sports activities in the school yard and rooms open to all ages.⁵⁴ The same concept of “opening spaces” for public interaction, beyond age and socio-economic divides is what *Swing do Pelo* was de facto doing, and so do the *congas* and the ambulant food vendors. *Swing*’s cultural center is one such recently “opened space” itself, joined by the *casas do samba* and the *capoeira* cultural centers around the country through the Ministry of Culture’s *Cultura Viva* and *Pontos de Cultura* program inspired in part by UNESCO’s emphasis on development through intangible heritage promotion.

That night, all my research of these government programs resurfaced under the sound of the maraca a kid was playing in the light from the open door of *Swing do Pelo*’s home. The United Nation’s symbol, the globe on the banner across the street, was the shape of the boy’s maraca. “How symbolic!,” I thought. How indicative of the ways in which global currents of cultural policy on heritage are appropriated and lived in the daily life-world of individuals and their communities around the world. It might be useful for a moment to visualize the beads sewn along the net of the maraca – the maraca of cultural policy - are the various cultural centers and performance groups connected in a national network of cultural centers (through the Department of Museums and Cultural Centers at the Ministry of Culture), as well as conceptually linked to other such networks like the Cuban *casas de cultura* and *focos culturales* in Santiago. Even more importantly, when playing the maraca in reality, the musician needs to *pre-sense* how his hand movement would multiply in a tune, because it takes parts of the second for the movement of the shaken net to hit the gourd and produce the sound. The same applies in particular to cultural policy, where the policy-makers need to think broadly, strategically, integrally and over a long period when trying to conceptualize how to help communities acquire more meaningful, creative life-styles. The creation of community cultural centers, the beads on the maraca of cultural policy, are one such key element. Though often contested, international conventions and national policies in the sphere of the arts appear in ethnographic research as particularly pliable to local creative molding and appropriation, precisely because it is human imagination that they purport to enhance.

Swing do Pelo’s daily marches, in their own words, “spreading happiness” is taking society a few steps closer to “opening spaces” that nurture certain forms of the “good distance” in public coexistence that Levi-Strauss hoped for. Similar spaces of sociability are opened by the *rodas de capoeira* employed in social work projects in low-income neighborhoods throughout Brazil, where UNESCO’s ideal of culture of peace – as utopic as it might sound – starts to take tangible shapes in

⁵⁴ Read more about the Escola Aberta Program at:

<http://www.unesco.org.br/noticias/ultimas/escolassergipe/noticias_view> . Consulted August 24, 2007.

dancing bodies and in drums, bathed with *axé* in Salvador and fed with rum in Cuba's *conga* and the *Tumba Francesa*.

...

COFFEE VAGARIES: FROM THE MILL TO THE TRIO ELECTRICO COFFEE CART

Aprendi cantar samba da minha avoã quando a gente vendia feijão na rua, y agora danço até quando estou doente...porque com a música toda doença vai embora!⁵⁵ Dona Dalva, *Samba de Roda Suerdieck* UNESCO-recognized group, Cachoeira, State of Bahia, Brazil

As clear in Dona Dalva's words, food in Brazil did (and it also did in Cuba) move not only in *outside-inside* direction from mouth to stomach, but the musical enchantment women used as "marketing" strategies in the market engaged food in an *inside-outside* dynamics: the appeal of the food was produced in the condensation of air in the stomach and lungs, transformed into vibration in the throat and spilled as a tune from the mouth towards the people, whom I observed often buying not the actual food item but the song attached to it. While Songhay sorcerers learn history, skills, and social relations by "eating" them (Stoller 1989⁵⁶) - epistemology literally linked to the indigestion of substances and the stomach being a locus of personhood and agency - in Brazil many *sambadeiras* (female samba dancers) acquired and practiced their singing skills, if not performing indigestion themselves, certainly through rhythmically stimulating others' "incorporation (intake) and transformation (digestion)" (Sklar 2007⁵⁷).

Similarly, *candomblé* rituals categorize people in terms of the penetration into their bodies, regardless of gender, where those penetrated are the ones who "give," and those who penetrate "eat." These verbs invert the standard idea of the penetrated as the one who "takes in," swallows, or "eats," as it is rather seen to be "giving" and generous for allowing the other one to eat and thrive. The inversion of the edible corporality reflects the alternative ways in which we can view gender and the culturally-relative gift economy of sex, in much the same way that the inversion of the edible chronotope of the "consecrated" *encrucilhadas* (crossroads) to whom food is offered reflects an alternative attitude towards space and time, which are being "given to," literally fed through food offerings for energetic reciprocity with man, and are not "eaten up" as most urban spaces by the human imposition of buildings and clocks.

Street food vendors have also been called *colporteurs* (from French⁵⁸), similar to the so-called pitchers in the USA,⁵⁹ who embody a traffic that is at once economic, symbolic, and performative,

⁵⁵ "I learned to sing from my grandmother while we were selling beans in the street, and now I dance even I am sick...somehow with the music all pain just goes away!" Dona Dalva, President of *Samba de Roda Suerdieck*, UNESCO-recognized group, Cachoeira, State of Bahia, Brazil. Interview conducted by Nadezhda Savova on August 20, 2007.

⁵⁶ Stoller, Paul. 1989. *The Taste of Ethnographic Things*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

⁵⁷ Sklar, Deidre. 2007. "Unearthing Kinesthesia." Banes, Sally and Andre Lepecki, ed., *The Senses in Performance*. New York:Routledge.

⁵⁸ Bloch, Ernst. 1989. Better Castles in the Sky at the Country Fair and Circus, in *Fairy Tales and Colportage* (1959). *The Utopian Function of Art and Literature: Selected Essays*, translated by J. Zipes and F. Mecklenburg. Cambridge: MIT Press.

⁵⁹ In a paper titled "Mashups and Moshes: On-line music and On-line Interaction," presented at Princeton's Center for Arts and Cultural Policy Research (CACPS) on November 15,2007, Trevor Pinch compares the online music community to market pitchers, where interactions are incrementally managed through building up of user commitments to other users to write reviews on others' music. The pitchers, at markets or streets in Europe, now often selling smuggled goods out of a suitcase, and creating commitment in the audience rallied around to participate in the price-pitching game. Web-sites architectures are similar to pitching stalls in the way in which buildings' architecture responds to the rolling street carts where smell and sound do not build commitment but aesthetic attraction and pleasure in the *habitus*. The online review-giving is

including anyone from food vendors to repairmen, peddlers of books and trinkets, newspaper man and gypsies with their dancing bears in Bulgaria, as well as occasional carnival-like figures at weekend fairs, such as the Greek *ghaitanáki* (a donkey formed by two men dancing to a drum) or the Brazilian Bumba-meu-boi festive figures and the “Red Devil” figure of an eccentric man who used to roller-skate all of Santiago de Cuba all dressed in red up until his last breath at an advanced age.

Colporteurs produce a special kind of spontaneous, creative cultural bricolage, to extend Levi-Strauss’ “bricolage” concept of myth-making as a classificatory structure of various materials and take it to denote not the structured but calportage’s chaotic, spontaneous rendering of reality as a conglomerate of transitive objects, signs, smells, flavours, and sounds. The ambulant trajectories of the colporteurs constitute “a choreographed time-keeping mechanism,” where “in ornamenting the everyday with the sensibility of the different, it [colportage] cuts up the edifice of the routine and prosaic, it forms fragments and animates broken up pieces of multiple realities in transit” (Seremetakis 1994: 33⁶⁰).

Nowadays, there are fewer and fewer old-time *ganhadeiras* in Salvador, and the occasional herb vendor or the vendors of *mungunzá* and boiled corn hardly ever sing but simply shout the kind of product they offer. An interesting new form of *ganhadeiros* has been emerging since the 80s and it is the *ambulant coffee vendors*. Most of them are adolescents, with still a few old-timers in their late 40s, and they gather in Praça da Se with their colorful mini-trucks, modelled after the *trio electrico*, or Carnaval trucks parading the streets with blasting music and dancers on top. The mini *trio electricos* are loaded with coolers of hot coffee in their bellies, and they leave both coffee aromas and rhythmic traces from the attached radio, stirring a square that is undoubtedly a *potable chronotope*.

SPATIAL ANOSTIA AND SPATIAL ANOSMIA

Wherever in the world street food vendors exist or once existed, the mentioning of them extracts smiles remembering childhood mouth-watering and endless stains on the shirt: from Cuba and Brazil, to people in Bulgaria dreamingly savoring the steam of the roasted pumpkin on a cold day, from an Italian girl who went to Egypt and found herself enchanted by the colporteurs’ old-Italian songs left unchanged since the temporary invasion, to my anthropology professor Carol Greenhouse remembering with nostalgia the ice-cream man in her native street.

....

Rita Rodriguez, a professor of dance at the Departamento de Artes Escénicas at the Federal University of Bahia (UFBA), spoke before high-school students at the International Festival of Art and Capoeira in August 2007, about the intrinsic connections between the bodily experiences of food and dance.

The body needs to eat the traditional food of a dance tradition in order to sense the rhythm and be able to recreate the movements! The body connects directly to nature and to its surroundings, and it needs to eat what is around!

also a pleasurable activity that goes beyond the exchange economy of inter-personal commitments and creates a parallel economy of aesthetics and pleasure. While pitchers gather people through the excitement in competition, *pregoneros* attract customers through music – interestingly linked to the online music exchange on ACIDPlanet. With the *pregoneros*, there is less bargaining for price, since the mobile, improvised music production provides the “value added” that sells the food, even when its quality might sometimes be questionable.

⁶⁰ Seremetakis, Nadia. 1994. *The Senses Still: Perception and Memory as Material Culture in Modernity*. Boulder, San Francisco, Oxford: Westview Press

For a while, her words had passed through my ear but stayed empty and silent inside. It was not until a *candomblé* feast, not until I savored the soft, slimy oca with fingers scooping from a freshly aromatic palm leaf did I *perceive* Rita's experience...not until then did I *perceive* what nurtured the smoothness, heaviness, and richness of those *candomblé* powerful imprints of bare feet in the ground. Rita had proposed, the loud drums reminded me:

Dance and culture in general is created and experienced with the body: as such, all tradition possesses mobility, which is linked to each person's intelligence and not to abstract notions such as popular – there is no popular, all is individual worlds of culture that are then shared but all start with each one's subjectivity, which is formed in a process of contamination from other bodies, contamination as a selective in-takes of information.

While later indulging in hot, crispy *acarajé* together, Rita exclaimed: "I loved *sooooo* much waking up as a child here in Pelourinho to the sound of the old *baiana* selling hot couscous with coco pieces! *Que gostoso!* (How delicious!," her voice extended in a long tasting of those palatable street shouts.

Rita's words, like those of so many people who spoke of food songs with endearment, echo what Bertha *La Pregonera* told me time after time, during those afternoons I spent with her selling *pimienta roja*, *pulpas de tamarindo*, and a smelly peeing potion she proclaimed her secret recipe:

It all gets so much tastier with the *pregón*...if not, you lose the joy of the street!⁶¹

...

The multiple ways in which people sensed how the *pregones* added meaning and life to their cities and thus to their *modes of dwelling* in these cities is precisely what constitutes my notion of *ambulant culinary kinaesthetics*, where music dances with smell and taste. To understand both Rita and Bertha's attachment to the food songs, it is useful to link sound to body by applying Rodaway's (1994) concept of "auditory geography" - where "auditory" implies more dynamic participation than "acoustic," as in the difference between hearing and listening. Rodaway examines how the auditory sense is primarily *physical* rather than chemical, because sound is born when motion spills vibration and resonance into substances such as air, water, and solids. While hearing depends on our head motions, the body itself has "auditory presence" through its vocal chords, the friction of its movement, and its biorhythms that enable us to measure the patterns of sounds (90-91⁶²): we "hear" not only with the ears, but with the whole body (98).

The key point of *participatory hearing as motion* reveals the importance to people of the particular dynamics involved in singing *and* walking, additionally enriched by the food aromas. "Participatory hearing" opens further insights into the link between sound and sense of belonging to a place by understanding hearing as a *physical*, deeply embodied experience of moving ears and mixing fluids: a vital physical aspect of the more semiotically studied "attunement" (Daniel 1996 in Collins 2007: 385⁶³) between subject and object of contemplation.

Edward Casey's (1997⁶⁴) seminal work of turning impersonal space into a place, where the body is embedded and interactively connected, can be applied to the semantic field of public/private spaces. In this dialectic, descendent of the ancient Greek binaries of *polis* (the city as collectivity, community)

⁶¹ "Se pone todo mucho mas sabroso con el pregon, si no, se pierde la alegria de la calle!"

⁶² Rodaway, Paul. 1994c. *Sensuous geographies: body, sense, and place*. London ; New York : Routledge.

⁶³ Collins, John. 2007. The Sounds of Tradition: Arbitrariness and Agency in a Brazilian Cultural Heritage Center." *Ethnos*, Vol. 72 (3): 383-407.

⁶⁴ Casey, Edward. 1997. *The Fate of Place: A Philosophical History*. University of California Press.

and the *oikos* (the home, the house as the space of the individual, the private), does street food have anything to tell us about the intermediary, more livable and pleasant, space between extremes of agorophobia and agorophilia?

In these questions on public-private spaces, *culinary kinaesthetics* relates not only to how street food vendors make kinetic and vibrant the aesthetics of a place (soundscape, smellscape, and spatial streetscape) but also how the vendors establish kin-like – the “kin” part interestingly moving *kineasthetics* from movement to kinship issues - relationships with their customers and even with the passers-by consuming only the smell. These kin-like relations occur in the awakening of childhood memories, in forging friendly relationships with strangers who become regular customers, and finally in bringing the intimate, home space of the kitchen on the street where the mother figure preparing food is multiplied in vendors of all ages and both sexes, and where people even often use the vendors home utensils and plates (particularly noticeable in Peru).

In relation to food in the streets, Jérôme Monnet (1996⁶⁵) argues that the private/public space dichotomy can be seen not only as the political/economic – where the street is a public space since it is under the collective responsibility, but the open-air food market is private because of individual gains – but space is also the materialization of the social/intimate, “a manifestation of the social order, of the will/manner of living together” (12): street food sale can thus be seen as what Monnet calls “the local art of living together” (13). Commerce has the peculiar function of “mercantile privatization of the street,” bringing the private into the public, and also bringing the public into the private, or the “publicization” of free-entrance spaces such as markets and shopping malls (12). Indeed, Lévi-Strauss argued that the essential human problem today is “to live together, with a good distance” (cited in Monnet 1996: 12⁶⁶). To this quest for the “good distance,” I take us along Lefebvre’s sensation that “where an intimacy occurs between ‘subject’ and ‘object,’ it must surely be the world of smell and the places they reside” (1991: 197⁶⁷).

Ervin Goffman’s classical “interaction rituals” analysis are pertinent to our experience of street food selling as a way to enrich his other famous analogy of the “back stage – front stage” distinction in restaurants and reveal the blurring of front-back boundaries in the privatized public space of moving the home kitchen into the open social “living room.” As Barbara Kirshenblatt-Gimblett has noted, restaurants progressively bring their kitchens out for performances of food-making; however, with street food selling, there is a far more immediate interaction as there are usually hardly any material separations between customer and seller – no counters or glass barriers – and the customer receives the food from the hand of the food-maker: extending the notion of “tangible acts” in stage performances (Fisher 2007⁶⁸), we can call *culinary haptic interactions* the tangible modes of aromatic (olfactory) and delicious (gustatory) communication. It becomes a sensuous way of breaking public-private binaries – the standard Cartesian body-mind opposition - as well as overcoming what Lefebvre called “disjunction⁶⁹” in architecture by linking the “ideal space” (spaces as products of mental processes) and “real space” (places products of social practices) (Tschumi in Kaye 2000:41⁷⁰). In *Sensuous Geographies*, Rodaway argues:

⁶⁵ Monnet, Jérôme. 1996. “Espacio público, comercio y urbanidad en Francia, México y Estados Unidos.” *Alteridades* 6 (11): 11-25.

⁶⁶ Monnet, Jérôme. 1996. “Espacio público, comercio y urbanidad en Francia, México y Estados Unidos.” *Alteridades* 6 (11): 11-25.

⁶⁷ Lefebvre, Henri. 1991. *The Production of Space*. Oxford:Blackwells.

⁶⁸ Fisher, Jennifer. 2007. “Tangible Acts: Touch Performances,” in Banes, Sally and Andre Lepecki, ed., *The Senses in Performance*. New York:Routledge: 166-178.

⁶⁹ Lefebvre, Henri. 1991. *The Production of Space*. Oxford: Blackwells.

⁷⁰ Kaye, Nick. 2000. *Site-Specific Art: Performance, Place, and Documentation*. New York: Routledge.

Olfactory geographies are like haptic geographies, both are quite intimate and immediate yet ordinarily much neglected as our attention is drawn to the geographical knowledge generated by the eyes and the ears. Yet, without the haptic and taste-smell system, much of our ability to locate ourselves in space, distinguish friend from foe, recognise food and identify ourselves within a home-space would be lost (61⁷¹).

Culture's etymology relates to Middle English for "cultivated land, cultivation," from the Latin *cultura*, and "tradition" in *Latin* means "handing over," a haptic activity that relates to tangible acts but is certainly inherent in intangible (heritage) practices and ideas. The haptic transmission of cultural sensibilities through street foods is evident also in the importance that locals and aliens assign to the olfactory transmission of culture – place turned by its characteristic smells into a peculiar olfactory *terroir* of a sort.

The deeply felt attachment to local smell posits the dangers of a *spatial anosmia* ("anosmia" as the physical human condition of losing the sense of smell), which occurs when a place loses/becomes deprived of its characteristic smells, of the spice of its character – the smell of food, of burning fireplace, of local flowers and blossoming trees, animal manure. *Spatial anosmia* is a phenomenon occurring globally, to varying degrees, because of multiple combinations of economic, social, cultural, and political forces, which become painfully internalized in people's misplaced memories of childhood, family, neighborhood, country. This is due to the fact that, "because smells are so intimately bounded up with the world, the context of a smell is not other smells [...] but simply the world" (Gell 1977:27⁷²).

As in *spatial anosmia*, the gustatory experience of a place can suffer from the disappearance of regional products and flavours, due to neo-liberal competition and food regulations, is what can be called *spatial anostia*: *á-nostos* in Greek means "tasteless," and it is the tastelessness driven by the local invasion on part of mass-produced, homogenized food – with its competitive advantage to local produce because of economies of scale – that also become the tasteless production of ever less spicy, sterilized places. *Spatial anostia* causes the "resocialization of existing consumer cultures and sensitivities," but even more deeply it is the disturbing "reorganization of public memory" (Seremetakis 1994: 3⁷³).

Seremetakis (1994) expands the notion of "commensality" – the act or practice of eating at the same table/sharing a meal – and crafts "reflexive commensality" to be "an exchange of sensory memories and emotions, and of substances and objects incarnating remembrance and feeling" (37). Applying "reflexive commensality" to street food vending, the street becomes the dining space of the home and there is often no table to eat at as people squat on steps, pavement sides, benches or stand upright: a *public* reflexive commensality of strangers receiving food from strangers, yet often quite personally prepared (the freshly fried *acarajé*) or sold as customers strike conversations and exchange jokes with the vendor. In the streets of Santiago and Salvador, unlike many other places, public reflexive commensality is also *rhythmic* because it is generated in the vendor's musical accompaniment of song or tune.

In Brazil and Cuba, traditionally the kitchen was separated and hidden, "the space, which relates the world of the house with the street, work, poverty, and marginality" (DaMatta 1991: 65⁷⁴), unlike the modern kitchens in Europe and the US where food is coming increasingly on theatrical display. I agree

⁷¹ Rodaway, Paul. 1994c. *Sensuous geographies: body, sense, and place*. London ; New York : Routledge.

⁷² Gell, Alfred. "Magic, Perfume, Dream," in Lewis, Ioan., ed. 1977. *Symbols and Sentiments: Cross-cultural Studies in Symbolism*. London: Academic Press: 25-39.

⁷³ Seremetakis, Nadia. 1994. *The Senses Still: Perception and Memory as Material Culture in Modernity*. Boulder, San Francisco, Oxford: Westview Press.

⁷⁴ DaMatta, Roberto. 1991. *Carnivals, Rogues, and Heroes: An Interpretation of the Brazilian Dilemma*. University of Notre Dame Press.

with DaMatta that Carnival – and I would argue the other more regular, daily *ambulant performative kinaesthetics* in Salvador and Santiago - is a way to bridge the impersonality of the street, epitomy of the *dura realidade da vida* (hardship of life), with the intimacy and warmth of the house⁷⁵ (66-67). But perhaps what most tangibly and certainly deliciously bridges the domestic and the public is street food vending's *culinary kinaesthetics*, making the triad of the square⁷⁶, the street, and the “centro” (center, downtown, market area) simultaneously more personal and enjoyable, less intimidating.

Culinary haptic interactions shake hands here with the notions of transmission of intangible heritage in very tangible, haptic terms, as evidenced in the statement on how “intangible heritage, handed down from generation to generation, is in a perpetual state of re-creation by those communities and groups in accordance with their *milieu*, their interaction with nature and their history, and it gives them a sense of identity and continuity, thus contributing to the promotion of respect for cultural diversity and human creativity” (61⁷⁷).

Many in Salvador remembered with nostalgia waking up to the morning smell of warm *cocadas* mixed with the merry shout of women passing through the streets. Where those odors suffused a sensorium of cultural intimacy, I heard tourists complain about the pungent smell of *acarajé*. The repulsion, however, was also often accompanied by a simultaneous recognition that “this is typical of Salvador,” “it makes the city unique,” etc. This ambivalence towards smellscapes in the already complicated concoction of public space is further magnified in the recent discourses on historical preservation. Conceptualizing and structuring the public space presents a huge challenge, since it is there where we find the crossing and negotiation of the greatest number of private interests: indeed, where the world's energies meet in constantly shifting *encrucilhadas*. In Mexico, for example, intellectuals fight over the appropriation of the public space through “consecrating works (*maniobras sacralizadoras*)” that exclude from all “the zones considered *witnesses* of national history” particularly the ambulant trade (*ambulantaje*) in order to leave space for those merchants “‘worthy’ of the heritage,” i.e. the upscale galleries for art and artisan works, hotels, specialty restaurants, etc. (17).

The “worthy witness” here is again the one that has power and money to look and smell good, to have a clean touch, unlike the greasy hands of the Mexican sope-maker. Yet why are the greasy hands of the acaraje vendor allowed to hand in food to tourists in the Pelourinho? Rather than seeing street food sales as “an essential urban form of Mexican sociability and spatiability (*espacialidad*)” (17), conservative conservationists' “clean” and aesthetic views on heritage are those that most endanger it. In developed countries like France, the small vendors is coming back to fashion in contrast to the large supermarkets “without house or home (*sin casa ni hogar*)” (Monnet 1996:20) in a new understanding of “humanism” related to urban preservation.

In Brazil, the “humanization” movement of Pelourinho's revitalization in Salvador did lead to displacement of people and the invasion of upscale businesses, but it also allowed and in fact favored a flourishing of ambulant vendors, who are in this context, unlike Mexico, seen as “worthy” “witnesses of

⁷⁵ In the Portuguese *lar* for home is derived from the Latin for “hearth.”

⁷⁶ The square is a “metaphor of its [the city's] cosmology” (DaMatta 1991:73), concentrating the main edifices of social life: church, town hall, a cultural center, while the “center” (*centro*) is usually the area of commercial concentration, and these spheres are symbolically and spatially divided in Latin America, but not in Europe where it is usually the central square where the market takes place – a sign of the important position of economic activity in social life.

⁷⁷ Koïchiro Matsuura, *Director-General of UNESCO*, “Address on the occasion of the Regional Forum on The Cultural Corridors of South East Europe: Common Past and Shared Heritage, a Key to Future Partnership,” Varna, Bulgaria, 20 May 2005, quoted in “Dialogue among Civilizations,” The Regional Summit Forum on Communication of Heritage: A New Vision of South East Europe. Opatija, Croatia, 31 May to 1 June 2006. Published in 2007. Paris: The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization.

heritage.” Singing is increasingly missing in Brazil, where shouting and voice change are more common than in Cuba.

The “consecration” of heritage stands in a paradoxical contrast with the concept of heritage being “tumbado,” which, if literally translated, means turned into a tomb, a repository for dead bodies, or a dead place itself, and indeed, the whole idea of recognizing it as “tumbado” is to save the place from physical death – but how can this salvaging then grow into social and cultural life? This is the challenge before heritage “humanization,” which needs to keep in mind that “a monument only acquires *status* as ‘historic’ when the proper population that coexists with it attributes it this quality (Françoise Choay, 1996⁷⁸).” Cultural tourism can be seen, indeed, as a “possibilitator of the preservation of the cultural values and quality of local life,” when “tourism is incorporated to add and not subtract value” (Simão, 2001: 69-75⁷⁹) through a variety of educational programs and a mix of tourist offering and daily residential spaces. In the Pelourinho, for example, a UNESCO officer pointed, after its “humanization,” there is not a single affordable bakery store, which could have coexisted alongside high-end restaurants and souvenir stores! Such small details reveal the importance of building a broad cultural strategy out of small, local, daily human needs and sensibilities.

THE SLOW MOVEMENT OF FOOD: REVIVING THE MUSICAL “ECO-GASTRONOMY”?

Globally, the Slow Food Movement, or “eco-gastronomy,”⁸⁰ has been a force of “virtuous globalization” appealing to a humanity that is swiftly running away from the tradition of eating slowly and of calmly *living* its commensality as a social ritual. Playing with the Movement’s name, I will call the phenomenon of ambulant food vendors the *Slow Movement of Food*, where the kinetic sounds and smells coalesce in a peculiar, alternative attitude towards food. Infact, ready-to-take or quickly made-on-the-spot street food might be seen by adherents to the Slow Food Movement as its precise enemy, and, indeed, people are not likely to eat street food in prolonged periods of commensality.

However, there is a different issue at stake here and it is one not of the *speed* of eating but of the social *distance* that food reconfigures between people and place and between people and other people. Cutting radically the physical and symbolic socio-economic gap between the vendor/maker of food and the consumer has its particular contribution to the “virtuous globalization,” since it starts with a “virtuous *localization*.” It is here, in the passing of hot *acarajé* from hand to hand, that street food interactions challenge the anomie of public space - with good taste even if not with eating manners of elegant “taste” - and thus implement on the ground a food-based “social coexistence” project.

People often know their street food vendor by name,. In the case of tourism, the socio-economic borderline is redrawn between vendor and customer, and even upper class Brazilians are more and more willing to consume street foods from time to time, as a ritualistic return to “heritage” that their healthy, clean, and refined lifestyles do not allow to be “lived” daily but heritage that is need as a charger of identity and belonging to a place, to the Salvador that smells and tastes like a greasy fritter. Munching on the same food and yet all seemingly different in dress and background, bunches of strangers often engaged in all kinds of improvised conversations: if the tempting smell had not stopped them for the few

⁷⁸ Choay, Françoise. 1996. *L'allégorie du patrimoine*. Paris: Seuil.

⁷⁹ SIMÃO, Maria Cristina Rocha. 2001. *Preservação do patrimônio cultural em cidades*. Belo Horizonte: Autêntica.

⁸⁰ The Ecogastronomy Initiative. Available at < <http://ecogastronomy.org/category/Virtuous-Globalization/> >. Consulted on November 12, 2007.

minutes to savor a bite and a petty talk, people would have otherwise kept on fleeting down the street for work or back home with hardly any sense of connection to either place or its occupants.

Indeed, the few minutes of street food-centered interactions coalesce in interesting instances of what Victor Turner called “spontaneous communitas,”⁸¹ in relation to the new sociabilities formed in the liminal, undefined state in a rite of passage when previous social boundaries are diluted: Turner focuses much on Carnival⁸², but in Santiago de Cuba and Salvador, not only their Carnivals but the more regular dynamics of *ambulant performative kinaesthetics* and of *culinary kinaesthetics* (not always ambulant) form various kinds of communitas on a far more daily, regular basis than the extraordinary festive times.

In particular in Cuba the merry *pregones*, though a few real singing vendors remain today, break routine apathy by producing smiles wherever they walk. Almost every person I asked about the *pregón* – more than a hundred, from government officials to artists, sanitary workers and academics to anyone in the street – often laughed and many actually sang me an improvised *pregón*. The food song touched memories of vendors’ songs, sounds, ringing bells⁸³, shouts, and the floating aromas that woke people up with the sensation that they knew where they were, where they came from, and how and why they belonged to that particular place. These people lamented the waning of the *pregón* tradition – no young vendors ever really sing anymore - and dreamed of its revival. But revive it how?

A state intervention in Santiago poses questions on what could be, and was not, creative government thinking about spicing up public life. Maria⁸⁴, an enthusiastic woman at the Municipal Department of Culture, had the passion to stimulate the *pregón* singing among young people and for a few years organized the *Festival del Pregón*, which brought together dozens of real-life *pregoneros* and that many more amateurs from the *casas de cultura* (community cultural centers) to participate in public parades with colourfully decorated food carts and baskets. Though the difficult economic situation in Cuba made the event ever smaller, people still remember its delicious festiveness and *pregoneros* talk about it as the sublime moment of public recognition of their work as “art” and “heritage” (*patrimonio*).

Such state-organized festivals are controversial productions of controlled public culture. It is often an artificial manner to “culturalize” a lived practice that spontaneously came into being and turn it into a structured “spectacle.” It is, indeed, the inverted process of what Elizabeth Povinelli (2002⁸⁵) calls “the cunning of recognition,” where indigenous Australians needed to perform before the state a set of cultural heritage practices in order get their land rights – and with them, their space, time, and mode of being and presence – recognized. “The cunning of recognition” in the case of the *pregón* is one not of bottom-up solicited but top-down awarded recognition in the hope of symbolically adding value to a

⁸¹ Tuner, Victor. “Passages, Margins, and Poverty: Religious Symbols of Communitas.” In Vincent, Joan, ed.. 2002. *The Anthropology of Politics: A Reader in Ethnography, Theory and Critique*. New York: Blackwell: 96-102

⁸² For more on the “liminal” in public celebrations, see Tuner, Victor. 1979. “ ‘Liminal’ to ‘Liminoid’ in Play, Flow and Ritual. *Process, Performance, and Pilgrimage: A Study in Comparative Symbolology*. New Delhi: Concept Publishing Company.

⁸³ Intriguingly, ice-cream vendors differ from the others in that they apply bells and not so much shouting/songs, and they apply bells in other cultures as well, such as Germany, India, and Turkey, to mention a few personal experiences. Perhaps, since ice-cream is generally targeted at children, it is the bell ring that somehow more distinctly draws their attention from their games.

⁸⁴ Interview conducted by Nadezhda Savova on June 22, 2007, Municipal Department of Culture, Santiago de Cuba.

⁸⁵ Povinelli, Elizabeth A. 2002. *The cunning of recognition: indigenous alterities and the making of Australian multiculturalism*. Durham : Duke University Press.

tradition, because of its deep connection to the unique values and sensations of the residents of Santiago de Cuba towards their city, as Maria emphasized.

It is important to think the State conceptualization of “tradition,” “people,” and most of all “sustainability of practice” before the agentic possibility where recognition is collective and empowering, when the people start re-evaluating and finding meaning in what was taken for granted. What does this process of recognition disable and enable? Certainly, the State has its own need for recognition of legitimacy by citizens, and while the Festival was certainly one of many public attempts to do precisely that by bringing “popular revelry,” it also became an important stimulus for the *pregón*, as many *pregoneros* told me they used to look forward to the event all year round. The problem, however, was precisely that it was an *event*, a *festival*, and not an ongoing project of revival of the tradition, through, let’s say, the *casas de cultura* which could have organized seminars and even workshops for old *pregoneros* to teach youth. Infact, when Bertha the *Pregonera* approached the Casa de Cultura of her village of Caney to organize a workshop, the authorities decided it did not fit their scheme of methodological classes.

If conceptualized as a sustainable project – with a certain dose of economic thinking always needed in cultural policy as far as the stimulation of a self-sustained local practices - the public intervention in the case of the *pregón* could have, indeed, functioned as interesting counterbalance of a pervading “free market” pragmatics where selling is not an art – except perhaps the art of cheating - and singing to food is seen as bordering lunacy. Most studies done on street food vendors relate explicitly to economics – and certainly not singing - either in the informal sector economics, focused on alternative markets and state regulations,⁸⁶ or the issues of food safety and health. These last points echo with the Western organic food movement that is less related to actual environmental concerns and rather symptomatic of a “phobic relation to the other, to an ‘external’ implicitly perceived as poisoning or poisoned” (Mieli: 172⁸⁷). Hardly anything about street food *singing!*

Street food vending certainly has its politics and its economics, as much as it has its art and spices. While in Santiago officials organize the *Festival del Pregón*, in Habana selling is purposefully made difficult for street food vendors who have to have a special permit to sell in the tourist-demarcated zones. Perhaps initiatives such as that of the Bangladesh and Sri Lankan governments to provide energy sources for cooking in the street⁸⁸ can teach other bureaucratic minds that generating *culinary kinaesthetics* is important to urban vitality, and energy sources could be not only plugs for electricity, but festivals reviving the ambulant food vending that has already disappeared in many parts of the world, in particular in its most beautiful form of improvised singing.

SOMETHING IS COOKING ON THE STAGE

The cross-fertilization of *ambulant culinary* and *ambulant performative kinaesthetics* taken off the street and enacted on the stage - food finally acquiring its formal recognition as an *art* and a *performance* – is intriguingly played out in the performances of the *Ganhadeiras samba* group. Balancing baskets of food on their heads by the Lagoon of Itapuá, the *Ganhadeiras* performed in front

⁸⁶ Almeida, H.G. 1996. *A questão do comércio ambulante*. Guarulhos: Prefeitura Municipal.; Cattani, A.D. 1996. *Trabalho e autonomia*. Petrópolis: Vozes; Ghersi, E. A economia informal em América Latina. Available at <<http://www.brazil.com/curjun99.html>>. Accessed on October 10, 2007.

⁸⁷ Mieli, Paola. 1999. “Brief Preliminary Considerations on Sameness, Otherness, Idiocy, and Transformation,” in *Being Human: The Technological Extensions of the Body*, ed. by Jacques Houis, Paola Mieli, and Mark Stafford. New York: Agincourt/Marsilio.

⁸⁸ Chowdhury, NA and S Llyanarachchi and L Tedd. 2001. “Energy and Street Food Vendors,» Boiling Point, available at <practicalaction.org>.

of the *Casa da Musica*, a small museum on local musical heritage funded by the Municipality, in an event organized by the University of Bahia as the closing celebration for an international seminar on *Ethnoscenology*.⁸⁹

They drew on the tradition of local washerwomen, what some of the older ones had been until not too long ago, and whose songs are mentioned in Stanley Stein's quoting from *O Vassourense* (1882) about women beating clothes to mournful songs. However, *As Ganhadeiras'* songs were suffused with idyllic landscapes community of women working together by the water, depicting the curvy lines of the lagoon. Lamentably, as the women later confided, the haunting beauty of the drying white sheets, swaying like masts in the air, was replaced by the rigid aesthetics of a municipal parking lot and a concrete alley by the Lagoon. Regretting the loss of their local kinaesthetics, the women danced with baskets full of fruit and vegetable, in swirling *rodas*: the first time I observed a *roda* moving, reminding me of Bulgarian circle dancing, called *horó*, the word that is the same in Greece and from where choreography came into being.

The creative putting of dance and food on the stage (Kirshenblatt-Gimblett 2007⁹⁰) subject to academic *ethnoscenologic* interest in questions on folklore, performance, and continuity and change, echoed in a room, in IPAC's (*Instituto do Patrimônio Artístico e Cultural*) office in the Pelourinho, where a talk on food took place as part of the International Festival of Art and Capoeira.

Macota Valdina has been recognized by IPAC as a *Mestre da Cultura Popular* (Master of Popular Culture) in line with the Ministry of Culture's *Cultura Viva* Program, which has a special line of action called the *Griot* Program (the West African word for story-teller), recognizing important local figures for their knowledge of tradition: all crafted under UNESCO's international incentive to governments to promote the knowledge of "Living Human Treasures." Macota Valdina is also a member of the Board of Directors of the World Cultural Forum (*Fórum Cultural Mundial*) for her knowledge of Bantu philosophy. Her words to the audience, mainly high-school students, rang even stronger for we were all anxious to taste the *acarajé* cooking outside.

Note in your heads the importance of when someone passes by the bus, or in the street, singing while selling food...note it, and know that this is *culture*, this is beauty and creativity!

The message was definitely internalized as the warm fritters melted into our mouths in the patio outside the room. Giving out food was Alaíde do Feijão, an expert cook (*culinaria*), also declared *Mestre da Cultura Popular*. She, like Dona Dalva from the samba group, used to sell beans with her mother in Praça Cairu. In 1993, Alaíde opened a small restaurant in Pelourinho, and her fame spurred

⁸⁹ The first information that comes on the Internet about the new field of the study of traditional performance arts called "ethnoscenology" is this text, written at the University of Paris. <<http://www-artweb.univ-paris8.fr/theatre/ethnoscenologie/ethnoscenology.htm>>. It is a field evolving in the University of Bahia and at the *Maison des Cultures du Monde* in Paris, affiliated with UNESCO. Other works in the field include: Roger D. Abrahms, "The Language of Festivals: Celebrating the Economy", *Celebration Studies in Festivity and Ritual*, ed. by Victor Turner, Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1982, pp.160-177.; Armindo Bião, "Etnocenologia, uma introdução, Etnocenologia: textos selecionados," Anna Blume, PPGAG, 1998, pp.15- 20.; Chérif Khaznadar, "Contribuição para uma definição do conceito de etnocenologia". *Emocenologia: textos selecionados*, Anna Blume, PPGAG, 1998, pp.55-59.; Demian Reis, "A dramaturgia histórica da dança do Quilombo" *Emocenologia: textos selecionados*, Anna Blume, PPGAG, 1998, pp.119- 133.; Brooks McNamara, "To the Reader", *American Popular Entertainments: Jokes, Monologues, Bits, and Sketches*, NY: Performing Arts Journal Publications, 1983, pp.10- 24.; "Popular Entertainment Issue, An Introduction" *TDR*, 61, 1974, pp 3-4.; "Scenography of Popular Entertainment", *TDR*, v.61, 1974, 16 - 24.

⁹⁰ Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, Barbara. 2007. "Making Sense of Food in Performance: The table and the stage," in Banes, Sally and Andre Lepecki, ed., *The Senses in Performance*. New York:Routledge.

the project *Festival Cultural da Culinária Afro-Baiana* as an homage given to her by the *Sociedade Recreativa, Cultural e Carnavalesca Bloco Alvorada*.

While Alaíde was giving out yummy Bahian delights, Jorge Conceição's *Boi Multicolor* project invaded the streets and the Praça das Artes with songs about fruits and vegetables, acknowledging a resistance to eating meat. What did he have to say about the living of the heritage of Bahian food, mainly meat and fish-based? I was to find on the very next day.

INTEGRAL FOOD – INTERGAL HERITAGE APPROACH

The next day, August 22, the International Day of Folklore⁹¹, the *Festival Internacional de Arte and Capoeira "Viva a Cultura Popular"* hosted another workshop on *Cultura Gastronômica*. The talk reminded me of **anthropofagia**, which literally means "eating humans," or "cannibalism," but which in Brazil in 1928, with the *Manifesto Anthropofago* by Osvaldo de Andrade, was proclaimed as the process of forming Brazilian identity amongst diverse cultures, where the symbolic practice of "eating humans" reveals the multilayered incorporations of the Other's values in constructing one's own. Food is the most sensorially available synthesis of cultural mixtures – *anthropofagia par excellence* - in Brazil, mixing together Arab couscous, African, Portuguese, native Indian, German, Ukrainian, Japanese, up to English Christmas bread pudding.

The metaphorical use of "eating" is helpful in exploring how the process of actual bodily indigestion of food in the streets of Salvador helps understand the links between food and music, vitally important physically and psychologically to the survival of the slaves and, in different, less material and much more symbolic ways, to their present-day descendants. Today, we also observe the *anthropofagia* of the modern imperatives of "health" and "integral food" stirred in with the traditional dishes.

I savored this interesting meal with Jorge Conceição. Jorge is an amazing man, who juggles like a master chef of a complex dish among being the director of the Museum of the Imaginary Object in Pelourinho, being a writer, dancer, great cook, former professor in sociology, and a professional believer in food as the premise of one's moral life-world. Jorge talked animatedly as always about the creativity in the food the slaves cooked from limited options and the need for similar creativity, as in any other art, to enrich tradition in accordance with current transformations and needs. "To be healthy today we need to start modifying the old cooking and eating habits, for example instead of frying why not baking, instead of meat more vegetables. Love and respect the *acarajé* vendors in the street, because they are preserving our history and culture, but do not eat like this every day!," Jorge urged in songs and dance.

Like the Slow Movement of Food, Jorge's integral food/integral development approach is another perspective on the vital role of food not only in physical but social, cultural, and moral terms. For Jorge, "integral" refers to seeing all as a unity, and I experienced how his kitchen in the Museum embodied "integrity" by being a kind of a culinary workshop for the perpetual rearrangement of the world as if made up of "imaginary objects." From natural food to natural, spontaneous dance, as he calls it, Jorge promotes what Ferreira Gullar called "cultura ingenua," that come from deep inside and not from outside academic didactics. Jorge argues:

If anyone wants to change, the change should begin with food. What and how you eat it defines one's attitude toward the world. Any change passes through the stomach and this is what development projects do not understand!

⁹¹ It is the day when the word "folklore" appeared for the first time.

Later that day we lived Jorge's concept of re-creating tradition in food through the innovation in folk dances with the *Ballet Folclórico da Bahia*, considered by the World Association of Dance Critics the best folk ballet since 1994 for interpretation of *samba de roda* and *capoeira*. The performance ended with *capoeiristas* dancing with *baianas* in colorful swirls of color and light with the authentic smoothness and elegance of the body that I had seen in the old ladies dancing in the *candomblé* rodas and the traditional *samba de roda* groups. The movement's beauty was kept but the formation of lines and circles and the vibration of the performance was young, fresh, and full of new life. And most interestingly, the innovation of choreographing a dance of the *capoeiristas* with the *baianas* was not an artificially staged folklore but a re-creation of elements from the past in the present just like the *roda* at the end of the *Caminhada* of Mestre Camisa, when the "new" *baianas*, the ones commodified by tourist propaganda and yet retaining their own local understandings of heritage in the way they slanted their shoulders and whirled their skirts to the *berimbau* beat, danced *spontaneously* the conventionalized steps of their ancestors.

"Integral heritage approach" speaks to Jorge's analogy of innovation within the continuity of tradition of art and cooking, and it is the constant brain-storming of what connects with what. The greasy typical food of Bahia – the *acarajé* fried in dendé oil, other foods fried in coconut oil, and the *feijoada* made with greasy meat pieces - was once conditioned by lack of food resources and was also needed for its high caloric content by the physically strained slave population. Nowadays, however, this food, in Jorge's opinion, needs to be regarded as important cultural heritage for its history and cultural specificities but one that should not be consumed daily in its most typical form – though certainly enjoyed every now and then, especially in traditional celebrations and rituals – but can rather be modified to include healthier ingredients and thus be adapted to the needs of the modern, sedentary lifestyle of not as much calorie expenditure. This model can be applied to any other cultural expression, where dances, songs, rituals, and festivals are no longer being lived within the natural ecology of the environmental cycles of work, rest, and procreation, but are performed on certain occasion as ritual of recharging of social memory through the sensorial experience of movements and food that embody sensations and values transmitted across generations.

Cultural policy makers who constantly call their policy strategies "integral" should then seriously consider the evolving linkages among human practices – from eating to dancing in the streets, being the example I have tackled here - in understanding how one can help make the connections even richer and more productive for the creation of a "shared public space": one propitious for a "good distance" of coexistence.

This "good distance" is precisely the distance that is eliminated when the private kitchen is brought out of the house and into the public realm, when food is personalized as the ambulant vendor and often food-maker hands over the food to the consumer and cuts distance with touch, look, smile, verbal communication, and kinaesthetic sympathy. And distance is further eliminated – thus "good distance" rethought – when strangers from various backgrounds rub sweaty bodies in the same pulse, among the buildings of a place that is ever more pleasant to both dine and dance with.

Musicians feed the drums so they are "happy" and bring others enjoyment; *candomblé* followers feed the crossroads to gain the benevolence of their energies; and ambulant food vendors feed people songs as garnish to food. In all these cases, *ambulant culinary* and *performative kinaesthetic* define song-making as a process of making public places more palatable and movable so that life within them has a rhythmic spice to it.

CONCLUSION

I never liked drinking coffee. Until that day I was sitting with Sara in her tiny kitchen in Santiago de Cuba, listening to her hands performing the sound of the Tajona coffee grinder. That day I sense the enormous charge of coffee, of the sweat, the tears, and the music infused in its sweet fumes. And I took it as a political act and personal agency to drink and remember.

While the *Tajona* dance in Cuba was written with grinding coffee movements, and the *pregones* in Salvador were instrumental in lifting up in musical pitches the burden of coffee cargos, nowadays coffee has been liberated for people to not only drink it but also sing and dance it with the *Tajona* dance through a Carnival street and a street blasting samba-reggae. Coffee in my country, Bulgaria, and all over the Balkans is what the Greeks call *sintrofiá*, a friendly companion (*tréfo* is to cultivate/feed and sin, or “with,” reveals its social dimension) (Seremetakis 1994: 13-14) of intimate talks among friends and family. But it is drink repository of gender roles (alcohol is for men, coffee for women gossip)ñ it was the dream of people under the Communist shortages in Bulgaria; and it is now associated with the rising levels of stress and sleep loss. In Cuba and Brazil coffee started as a racially discriminatory, elitist drink whose flavor is now that much richer and tempting for havening expanded from slavery’s artefact to the aromatic enlivening of space enacted in the *Tajona* dance and the musical coffee carts in Salvador.

This research tried to answer to the question: “What kinds of social energies, symbols, messages, and embodied memories are at stake in these public performances?” It argued that, within the framing of *moving* and *un-moving* heritage, *ambulant performative kinaesthetics* performs the role of social mixer of socio-economic divides, marker of social time, animateur of architectural space, and certainly source of regular entertainment and, shortly put, happiness for residents who cannot imagine their cities without their public music and dance.

Culinary heritage kinaesthetics cut not only the socio-economic divide, where tourists and locals eat at the same places outside of fancy restaurants: though driven by different motivations, ones in a genuine search for an authentic local sample and the others often due to economic constraints, the clients of street food vendors become immersed in a street food economy of exchange that bridges the public-private frontiers. Street food does so by bringing the intimate space of the kitchen in the street, by promoting a tactile, haptic, and thus ultimately intimate interactions between food provider and consumer. Finally, the research exposes the danger of *spatial anostia* and *spatial asnosmia* by revealing the deep, emotional connection people feel to the food songs and sounds of Santiago and Salvador.

The *integral food movement* presents a useful paradigm for understanding what it could be to implement an “integral heritage approach,” a term widely used by cultural workers but never clearly defined. Jorge’s insistence of considering traditional Bahian food “heritage” which is to be cherished for its history and embodiment of values, life histories, struggles, and cultural sensitivities, but which is not to be consumed on a daily basis with its most traditional greasy content – not to be “lived” as an “integral” part of one’s daily life – but is rather to be transformed and prepared with healthier ingredients and cooking techniques, necessarily in a routine of little motion and calories expenditure.

If heritage is understood in terms of the constant need for innovation, adaptation, and meaningful, special performance – its *daily* living impossible to reconcile with our current life-styles – then safe-guarding can truly be “integral” by creating the most favorable conditions for its performance, however not only through the encouragement of heritage street presence, as in the *Festival del Pregón* and the *baianas* special status in Salvador, but also by the creation of sustainable public support for daily creative activities for people from all ages at already existing cultural spaces, such as the *pontos de cultura* in Brazil and the *casas de cultura* and *focos culturales* in Cuba.

For a healthy and meaningful social life in the context of social, political, and economic change, heritage can present the creative cultural change that is not disruptive but that is perhaps the only one “policy reform,” if well developed at the level of the ministries of culture and UNESCO, that, unlike the neo-liberal “shock therapy,” is an actual “art therapy approach” based on the entertaining and spiritual performance of tradition, when insisting on its immutable authenticity is not only unhealthy and rather unfeasible, but also highly non-imaginative.

REFERENCES

- Almeida, H.G. 1996. *A questão do comércio ambulante*. Guarulhos: Prefeitura Municipal.;
- Cattani, A.D. 1996. *Trabalho e autonomia*. Petrópolis: Vozes; Ghersi, E. A economia informal em América Latina. Available at <<http://www.brazil.com/curjun99.html>>. Accessed on October 10, 2007.
- Badiou, Alain. 1993. “Ples kot metafora misli,” in Emil Hrvatin (ed.) *Teorije sodobnega plesa*, Ljubljana: Maskam pp. 25-39, in *Kunst* 2003: 62.
- Banes, Sally and Andre Lepecki. 2007. *The Senses in Performance*. New York:Routledge.
- Batista, Eliezer and Marco Antonio Fujihara. 2006. *Caminhos da Sustentabilidade no Brasil*. Brasilia: Terra das Artes.
- Barnet, Miguel. 1966. *Apuntes sobre el folklore cubano*, Dirección Provincial de Cultura: La Habana.
- Bloch, Ernst. 1989. Better Castles in the Sky at the Country Fair and Circus, in *Fairy Tales and Colportage (1959)*. *The Utopian Function of Art and Literature: Selected Essays*, translated by J. Zipes and F. Mecklenburg. Cambridge: MIT Press.
- Browning, Barbara. *Samba*. 1995. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Carter, Paul. 1996. *The lie of the land*. London ; Boston : Faber and Faber.
- Caruth, Cathy. 1995. *Trauma:Explorations in Memory*. Baltimore: John Hopkins University.
- Casey, Edward. 1997. *The Fate of Place: A Philosophical History*. University of California Press.
- Choay, Françoise. 1996. *L'allégorie du patrimoine*. Paris: Seuil.
- Chowdhury, NA and S Llyanarachchi and L Tedd. 2001. “Energy and Street Food Vendors,» Boiling Point, available at <practicalaction.org>.
- Collins, John. 2007. The Sounds of Tradition: Arbitrariness and Agency in a Brazilian Cultural Heritage Center.” *Ethnos*, Vol. 72 (3): 383-407.
- DaMatta, Roberto. 1991. *Carnivals, Rogues, and Heroes: An Interpretation of the Brazilian Dilemma*. University of Notre Dame Press.
- Daniel, Yvonne. 1995. *Dance and Social Change in Contemporary Cuba*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Derrida, Jacques. 1972. *Margins of Philosophy*. Translated by Alan Bass. The University of Chicago Press: Chicago.
- Djanie, Nicholas Kotei, drummer from Ghana and participant in peace-building workshops, quoted in Cohen, Cynthia and Leslie Yalen. July 2007. “Complementary Approaches to Coexistence

Work: Focus on Coexistence and the Arts.” *Coexistence International Project at Brandeis University*. Available at <<http://www.brandeis.edu/coexistence/>>. Consulted on October 22, 2007.

Downey, Greg. 2005. *Learning Capoeira: Lessons in Cunning from an Afro-Brazilian Art*. New York: Oxford University Press.

The Ecogastronomy Initiative. Available at < <http://ecogastronomy.org/category/Virtuous-Globalization/> >. Consulted on November 12, 2007.

Escola Aberta Program. Available at: <http://www.unesco.org.br/noticias/ultimas/escolassergipe/noticias_view> . Consulted August 24, 2007.

Fisher, Jennifer. 2007. “Tangible Acts: Touch Performances,” in Banes, Sally and Andre Lepecki, ed., *The Senses in Performance*. New York:Routledge: 166-178.

Fryer, Peter. 2000. *Rhythms of Resistance: African Musical Heritage in Brazil*. Wesleyan University Press.

Eliade, Mircea. 1959. *Cosmos and History: The Myth of the Eternal Return*. New York: Harper and Row.

Garbett, G.K. 1970. “The Analysis of Social Situations.” *MAN*, 5: 214-227.

Gibson, J.J. 1986. *The Ecological Approach to Visual Perception*. Lawrence Erlbaum.

Gil, José. 2006. “Paradoxical Body.” *TDR*, Winter 2006, Vol. 50, No. 4, Winter: 21-35.

Gil, Gilberto, Minister of Culture, Brazil. 2006. “Cultural Cartography,” Brochure on Brazilian Intangible Heritage Preservation. Brasilia: Ministry of Culture, IPHAN.

Hammoudi, Abdellah. 1993. *The Victim and Its Masks: an essay on sacrifice and masquerade in the Maghreb*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Kaye, Nick. 2000. *Site-Specific Art: Performance, Place, and Documentation*. New York: Routledge.

Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, Barbara. Foreword in Long, Lucy M, ed. 2004. *Culinary tourism: Material Worlds*. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky.

Koïchiro Matsuura, *Director-General of UNESCO*, “Address on the occasion of the Regional Forum on The Cultural Corridors of South East Europe: Common Past and Shared Heritage, a Key to Future Partnership,” Varna, Bulgaria, 20 May 2005, quoted in “Dialogue among Civilizations,” The Regional Summit Forum on Communication of Heritage: A New Vision of South East Europe. Opatija, Croatia, 31 May to 1 June 2006. Published in 2007. Paris: The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization.

Kunst, Bojana. 2003. “Subversion and the Dancing Body: Autonomy on Display.” *Performance Research* 8(2): 61-68.

Kwinter, Sanford. 2002. *Architectures of Time: Toward a Theory of the Event in Modernist Culture*. Boston: MIT Press.

Lefebvre, Henri. 1968. *Everyday Life in the Modern World*. Editions Gallimard: Paris.

Lefebvre, Henri. 1991. *The Production of Space*. Oxford:Blackwells.

Lepecki, Andre. 2004. “Stumble Dance.” *Women and Performance: A Journal of Feminist Theory*, Issue 27 (14:1): 47-61.

MacCannell. 1999. *The Tourist: A New Theory of the Leisure Class*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Marin, Victor. Office of Intangible Heritage. UNESCO Cluster Office for Latin America. Habana, Cuba. Interview conducted by Nadezhda Savova on July 4, 2007.

Martin, Emily. 1994. *Flexible Bodies: Tracking Immunity in American Culture: From the Days of Polio to the Age of AIDS*. Boston: Beacon Press.

Mieli, Paola. 1999. "Brief Preliminary Considerations on Sameness, Otherness, Idiocy, and Transformation," in *Being Human: The Technological Extensions of the Body*, ed. by Jacques Houis, Paola Mieli, and Mark Stafford. New York: Agincourt/Marsilio.

Monnet, Jérôme. 1996. "Espacio público, comercio y urbanidad en Francia, México y Estados Unidos." *Alteridades* 6 (11): 11-25.

Ness, Sally Ann. 1992. *Body, Movement, and Culture: Kinesthetic and Visual Symbolism in a Philippine Community*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press

Novalis, "Europa," lecture presented in 1799, published in 1826, in Sloterdijk, Peter. 2006. "Mobilization of the Planet from the Spirit of Self-Intensification." *TDR: The Drama Review* 50:4 (T192), Winter.

Pontos de Cultura Program, Ministry of Culture, Available at <
http://www.cultura.gov.br/programas_e_acoes/cultura_viva/programa_cultura_viva/pontos_de_cultura/>

Povinelli, Elizabeth A. 2002. *The cunning of recognition: indigenous alterities and the making of Australian multiculturalism*. Durham : Duke University Press.

Renato Almeida in *Historia da Musica Brasileira* (1942) recorded some songs of sellers of sweets, fruit, and ice-cream.

Rodaway, Paul. 1994c. *Sensuous geographies: body, sense, and place*. London ; New York : Routledge.

Royce, Anya Peterson. 2002a. "From Body as Artifact to Embodied Knowledge: An Introduction to the Reprint Edition." In *The Anthropology of Dance*, repr. ed., by Anya Peterson Royce, xv-xxv. London: Dance Books.

Valéry, Paul. "Poetry and Abstract Thought in the Art of Poetry," vol. 7, *The Collected Works of Paul Valéry*, ed. J. Mathews, Princeton, 1955-70.

Van Velson, J. 1967. *The Extended Case Method and Situational Analysis. The Craft of Social Anthropology*. London: Tavistock.

"Salvador sedia encontro de representantes de pontos de cultura," Agência Brasill, Available at <
<http://jbonline.terra.com.br/extra/2007/07/13/e13076933.html> >. Consulted on September 18, 2007.

Savigliano, Marta. 1995. *Tango: The Political Economy of Passion*. Bloomington: University of Indiana Press.

Schecner, Richard. 1993. *The Future of Ritual: Writings on Culture and Performance*. Routledge: New York.

Schivelbusch, Wolfgang. 1986 [1977]. *The Railway Journey: The Industrialization of Time and Space in the 19th Century*. Berkeley: The University of California Press.

Simao, Maria Cristina Rocha. 2001. *Preservação do patrimônio cultural em cidades*. Belo Horizonte: Autêntica.

Sklar, Deidre. 2007. "Unearthing Kinesthesia." Banes, Sally and Andre Lepecki, ed., *The Senses in Performance*. New York:Routledge.

Stoller, Paul. 1989. *The Taste of Ethnographic Things*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Strathern, Andrew. 1996. *Body Thoughts*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.

Tuner, Victor. "Passages, Margins, and Poverty: Religious Symbols of Communitas." In Vincent, Joan, ed.. 2002. *The Anthropology of Politics: A Reader in Ethnography, Theory and Critique*. New York: Blackwell: 96-102.

Tuner, Victor. 1979. “ ‘Liminal’ to ‘Liminoid’ in Play, Flow and Ritual. *Process, Performance, and Pilgrimage: A Study in Comparative Symbology*. New Delhi: Concept Publishing Company.

Wodiczko, Krzysztof, Polish architect, quoted in Kaye, Nick. 2000. *Site-Specific Art: Performance, Place, and Documentation*. New York: Routledge.

Yoko Ono, pp. 170, in Fisher, Jennifer. 2007. “Tangible Acts: Touch Performances,” in Banes, Sally and Andre Lepecki, ed., *The Senses in Performance*. New York:Routledge: 166-178.